

**4A:2-1.6 Reconsideration of decisions**

(a) Within 45 days of receipt of a decision, a party to the appeal may petition the Commissioner or Board for reconsideration.

(b) A petition for reconsideration shall be in writing signed by the petitioner or his or her representative and must show the following:

1. The new evidence or additional information not presented at the original proceeding which would change the outcome and the reasons that such evidence was not presented at the original proceeding; or
2. That a clear material error has occurred.

(c) Each party must serve copies of all materials submitted on all other parties.

Amended by R.2006 d.271, effective July 17, 2006.  
See: 37 N.J.R. 4345(a), 38 N.J.R. 3016(b).

In (a), substituted "Within 45 days of" for "Upon the".

**Case Notes**

A motion for reconsideration of a final administrative decision must be made within the period provided for the taking of an appeal. *Matter of Hill*, 241 N.J.Super. 367, 575 A.2d 42 (A.D.1990).

Senior corrections officer was an employee on date when complaint which formed basis of harassment conviction was filed, for purposes of forfeiture statute. *Moore v. Youth Correctional Institute at Annandale*, 230 N.J.Super. 374, 553 A.2d 830 (A.D.1989), affirmed 119 N.J. 256, 574 A.2d 983.

Senior corrections officer's criminal conviction for harassing his immediate superior was one "involving or touching" his employment. *Moore v. Youth Correctional Institute at Annandale*, 230 N.J.Super. 374, 553 A.2d 830 (App.Div.1989) affirmed 119 N.J. 256, 574 A.2d 983.

**4A:2-1.7 Specific appeals**

(a) For specific appeal procedures see:

1. Awards in State service (N.J.A.C. 4A:6-6.10);
2. Classification (N.J.A.C. 4A:3-3.9);
3. Discipline, major (N.J.A.C. 4A:2-2);
4. Discipline, minor (N.J.A.C. 4A:2-3);
5. Discrimination in State service (N.J.A.C. 4A:7-3.2 and 3.3);
6. Employment list removal for medical reasons (N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.5);
7. Employment list removal for psychological reasons (N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.5);
8. Examinations (N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6);
9. Grievances (N.J.A.C. 4A:2-3);
10. Layoffs (N.J.A.C. 4A:8-2.6);
11. Overtime in State service (N.J.A.C. 4A:3-5.10);

12. Performance Assessment Review in State service (N.J.A.C. 4A:6-5.3);

13. Reprisals (N.J.A.C. 4A:2-5);

14. Resignations (N.J.A.C. 4A:2-6);

15. Salary (job reevaluation) in state service (N.J.A.C. 4A:3-4.3);

16. Sick leave injury in State service (N.J.A.C. 4A:6-1.7); and

17. Supplemental compensation on retirement in State service (N.J.A.C. 4A:6-3.4).

(b) Any appeal not listed above must be filed in accordance with N.J.A.C. 4A:2-1.1.

Administrative correction to (a), with deletion of (a)11 and renumbering of old (a)12-18 to new (a)11-17.

See: 22 N.J.R. 165(a).

Amended by R.2006 d.271, effective July 17, 2006.

See: 37 N.J.R. 4345(a), 38 N.J.R. 3016(b).

Deleted ".1 et seq." following N.J.A.C. references throughout; in (a)5, substituted "and 3.3" for "through 4A:7-3.4"; and in (a)11, deleted "et seq." following N.J.A.C. reference.

**Case Notes**

Appeals to Department of Personnel (DOP) and Merit System Board by police officer were timely. *Matter of Allen*, 262 N.J.Super. 438, 621 A.2d 87 (A.D.1993).

SUBCHAPTER 2. MAJOR DISCIPLINE

**Cross References**

Applicability of this subchapter to SES members, see N.J.A.C. 4A:3-2.9.

**4A:2-2.1 Employees covered**

(a) This subchapter applies only to permanent employees in the career service or a person serving a working test period.

(b) Appointing authorities may establish major discipline procedures for other employees.

(c) When the State of New Jersey and the majority representative have agreed pursuant to the New Jersey Employer-Employee Relations Act, N.J.S.A. 34:13A-5.3, to a procedure for appointing authority review before a disciplinary action is taken against a permanent employee in the career service or an employee serving a working test period, such procedure shall be the exclusive procedure for review before the appointing authority.

(d) When the State of New Jersey and the majority representative have agreed pursuant to the New Jersey Employer-Employee Relations Act, N.J.S.A. 34:13A-5.3, to a disciplinary review procedure that provides for binding arbitration of disputes involving a disciplinary action which would be otherwise appealable to the Board under N.J.A.C.

4A:2-2.8, of a permanent employee in the career service or a person serving a working test period, such procedure shall be the exclusive procedure for any appeal of such disciplinary action.

Amended by R.2006 d.271, effective July 17, 2006.  
See: 37 N.J.R. 4345(a), 38 N.J.R. 3016(b).  
Added (c) and (d).

#### Case Notes

Ordinarily, permanent civil service employees can be discharged or demoted only for cause, and they have pre-termination appeal and hearing rights; however, provisional employees can be terminated at any time at the discretion of the employer. *Melani v. County of Passaic*, 345 A.2d 579.

Department of Energy was not equitably estopped from returning employee to his permanent position as senior engineer when promotional examination was not given between date of his provisional appointment and date of demotion (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-16.8). *O'Malley v. Department of Energy*, 109 N.J. 309, 537 A.2d 647 (1987).

Doctrine of equitable estoppel inapplicable to allow provisional employee to retain position (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-16.8). *Omrod v. N.J. Dep't of Civil Service*, 151 N.J. Super. 54, 376 A.2d 554 (App.Div.1977) certification denied 75 N.J. 534, 384 A.2d 513.

#### 4A:2-2.2 Types of discipline

(a) Major discipline shall include:

1. Removal;
2. Disciplinary demotion; and
3. Suspension or fine for more than five working days at any one time.

(b) See N.J.A.C. 4A:2-2.9 for minor disciplinary matters that are subject to a hearing, and N.J.A.C. 4A:2-3 for all other minor disciplinary matters.

(c) The length of a suspension in a Final Notice of Disciplinary Action, a Board decision or a settlement, when expressed in "days," shall mean working days, unless otherwise stated.

Amended by R.2006 d.271, effective July 17, 2006.  
See: 37 N.J.R. 4345(a), 38 N.J.R. 3016(b).

In (a)2, added "and" at the end; in (a)3, substituted a period for a semi-colon at the end; deleted (a)4 and (a)5; and added (b) and (c).

#### Case Notes

Ordinarily, permanent civil service employees can be discharged or demoted only for cause, and they have pre-termination appeal and hearing rights; however, provisional employees can be terminated at any time at the discretion of the employer. *Melani v. County of Passaic*, 345 A.2d 579.

Employee suspended for 10 days from position as account clerk for failure to deposit money (\$700,000) within 48-hour period required by N.J.S.A. 40A:5-15 and late deposit by mail of \$355,000; 10-day suspension upheld and \$500 fine imposed. *Kennedy v. City of Burlington*, 11 N.J.A.R. 20 (1988).

Employee did not demonstrate that Department of Labor's request to reallocate career position of Director to SES was made in bad faith and

without complying with statutory procedures governing disciplinary proceedings. *Matter of Baykal*, 707 A.2d 467, 309 N.J. Super. 424.

#### 4A:2-2.3 General causes

(a) An employee may be subject to discipline for:

1. Incompetency, inefficiency or failure to perform duties;
2. Insubordination;
3. Inability to perform duties;
4. Chronic or excessive absenteeism or lateness;
5. Conviction of a crime;
6. Conduct unbecoming a public employee;
7. Neglect of duty;
8. Misuse of public property, including motor vehicles;
9. Discrimination that affects equal employment opportunity (as defined in N.J.A.C. 4A:7-1.1), including sexual harassment;
10. Violation of Federal regulations concerning drug and alcohol use by and testing of employees who perform functions related to the operation of commercial motor vehicles, and State and local policies issued thereunder; and
11. Other sufficient cause.

Amended by R.1990 d.308, effective June 18, 1990.

See: 22 N.J.R. 1015(b), 22 N.J.R. 1915(a).

Added misuse of public property, including motor vehicles.

Amended by R.1994 d.618, effective December 19, 1994.

See: 26 N.J.R. 3507(a), 26 N.J.R. 5000(a).

Amended by R.1995 d.415, effective August 7, 1995.

See: 27 N.J.R. 1837(a), 27 N.J.R. 2884(a).

Added (a)10, and recodified former (a)10 as (a)11.

#### Case Notes

A public employee cannot be dismissed for failure to submit to a procedure violative of his state and federal constitutional rights. *Reames v. Department of Public Works, City of Paterson*, 310 N.J. Super. 71, 707 A.2d 1377 (A.D. 1998).

Off-duty firefighter's utterance of racial epithet at on-duty police officer during traffic stop constituted conduct unbecoming both firefighter and public employee. *Karins v. City of Atlantic City*, 706 A.2d 706, 152 N.J. 532 (N.J. 1998).

Merit System Board of State Department of Personnel did not have exclusive jurisdiction for prosecution of forfeiture action against senior corrections officer. *State v. Lee*, 258 N.J. Super. 313, 609 A.2d 513 (A.D.1992).

Issue of forfeiture of public employment by turnpike utility worker did not have to be first addressed by administrative agency to determine whether there was any relationship between crimes committed and employment duties. *State v. Baber*, 256 N.J. Super. 240, 606 A.2d 891 (L.1992).

Turnpike utility worker's convictions for failure to deliver drugs to police and for simple assault upon two police officers were offenses

"involving or touching" his job so as to justify forfeiture of employment. *State v. Baber*, 256 N.J.Super. 240, 606 A.2d 891 (L.1992).

Order directing forfeiture of public employment may be incorporated in sentence of criminal convictions. *State v. Baber*, 256 N.J.Super. 240, 606 A.2d 891 (L.1992).

Forfeiture of public employment, for conviction of failure to file gross income tax return was not a bill of attainder. *Ayars v. New Jersey Dept. of Corrections*, 251 N.J.Super. 223, 597 A.2d 1084 (A.D.1991).

Forfeiture of public employment for conviction for failure to file gross income tax return did not violate double jeopardy. *Ayars v. New Jersey Dept. of Corrections*, 251 N.J.Super. 223, 597 A.2d 1084 (A.D.1991).

Dismissal was appropriate sanction for refusal by correction officers to submit to mandatory drug testing. *Caldwell v. New Jersey Dept. of Corrections*, 250 N.J.Super. 592, 595 A.2d 1118 (A.D.1991), certification denied 127 N.J. 555, 606 A.2d 367.

When public employee is convicted of petty disorderly persons offense, analysis of nexus between crime and employment is required to determine if there is sufficient relationship between the two to warrant harsh penalty of forfeiture. *Moore v. Youth Correctional Institute at Annandale*, 119 N.J. 256, 574 A.2d 983 (1990).

When public employee is convicted of petty disorderly persons offense, connection between conviction and employment will have to be examined initially by governmental department in which employee

works, then by appropriate administrative agencies, and employee will retain right to appeal to appellate division. *Moore v. Youth Correctional Institute at Annandale*, 119 N.J. 256, 574 A.2d 983 (1990).

Employees who are convicted of petty disorderly persons offense and recognize that their offense does touch and involve their employment can for good cause request county prosecutor or Attorney General to petition sentencing court for waiver of resultant forfeiture of public employment. *Moore v. Youth Correctional Institute at Annandale*, 119 N.J. 256, 574 A.2d 983 (1990).

Even in cases in which public employee does not obtain formal waiver of forfeiture of public employment resulting from conviction of petty disorderly persons offense, department should consider whether punishment of forfeiture fits crime. *Moore v. Youth Correctional Institute at Annandale*, 119 N.J. 256, 574 A.2d 983 (1990).

Inquiry into whether offense by public employee involves and touches on public employment to extent of meriting forfeiture of employment requires careful examination of facts and evaluation of various factors. *Moore v. Youth Correctional Institute at Annandale*, 119 N.J. 256, 574 A.2d 983 (1990).

Offense committed by public employee would not be considered not to involve or touch employment, so as to support forfeiture of public employment, based on fact that offense does not take place during employment hours or on employment grounds. *Moore v. Youth Correctional Institute at Annandale*, 119 N.J. 256, 574 A.2d 983 (1990).

Traffic signal repairer removed for falsifying application for employment with regard to criminal convictions. *Florenzo v. Bergen County Department of Public Works*, 96 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 22.

Police officer who lost police radio through carelessness was appropriately fined. *Przybyszewski v. Gloucester Township Police Department*, 95 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 623.

**4A:2-2.5 Opportunity for hearing before the appointing authority**

(a) An employee must be served with a Preliminary Notice of Disciplinary Action setting forth the charges and statement of facts supporting the charges (specifications), and afforded the opportunity for a hearing prior to imposition of major discipline, except:

1. An employee may be suspended immediately and prior to a hearing where it is determined that the employee is unfit for duty or is a hazard to any person if permitted to remain on the job, or that an immediate suspension is necessary to maintain safety, health, order or effective direction of public services. However, a Preliminary Notice of Disciplinary Action with opportunity for a hearing must be served in person or by certified mail within five days following the immediate suspension.

2. An employee may be suspended immediately when the employee is formally charged with a crime of the first, second or third degree, or a crime of the fourth degree on the job or directly related to the job. See N.J.A.C. 4A:2-2.7.

(b) Where suspension is immediate under (a)1 and (a)2 above, and is without pay, the employee must first be apprised either orally or in writing, of why an immediate suspension is sought, the charges and general evidence in support of the charges and provided with sufficient opportunity to review the charges and the evidence in order to respond to the charges before a representative of the appointing authority. The response may be oral or in writing, at the discretion of the appointing authority.

(c) The employee may request a departmental hearing within five days of receipt of the Preliminary Notice. If no request is made within this time or such additional time as agreed to by the appointing authority or as provided in a negotiated agreement, the departmental hearing may be considered to have been waived and the appointing authority may issue a Final Notice of Disciplinary Action.

(d) A departmental hearing, if requested, shall be held within 30 days of the Preliminary Notice of Disciplinary Action unless waived by the employee or a later date as agreed to by the parties.

(e) Appeals concerning violations of this section may be presented to the Commissioner through a petition for interim relief. See N.J.A.C. 4A:2-1.2.

Amended by R.1989 d.569, effective November 6, 1989.  
See: 21 N.J.R. 1766(a), 21 N.J.R. 3448(b).

Added new (e).  
Amended by R.1992 d.414, effective October 19, 1992.  
See: 24 N.J.R. 2491(a), 24 N.J.R. 3716(a).  
Revised (a).

**Law Review and Journal Commentaries**

Discrimination—Collateral Estoppel—Police Officers. *Judith Nallin*, 138 N.J.L.J. No. 1, 49 (1994).

**Case Notes**

The requirement of holding departmental hearing within 30 days of service of preliminary notice of disciplinary action against career service public employee was not jurisdictional, and thus, an appointing authority may proceed with disciplinary charges even if it fails to conduct a departmental hearing within the statutorily mandated period. *Goodman v. Department of Corrections*, 367 N.J.Super. 591, 844 A.2d 543.

Ordinarily, permanent civil service employees can be discharged or demoted only for cause, and they have pre-termination appeal and hearing rights; however, provisional employees can be terminated at any time at the discretion of the employer. *Melani v. County of Passaic*, 345 A.2d 579.

Adequate consideration given provisions of Law Against Discrimination. *Ensslin v. Township of North Bergen*, 275 N.J.Super. 352, 646 A.2d 452 (A.D.1994), certification denied 142 N.J. 446, 663 A.2d 1354.

Procedural irregularities at departmental level; cured by hearing at agency level. *Ensslin v. Township of North Bergen*, 275 N.J.Super. 352, 646 A.2d 452 (A.D.1994), certification denied 142 N.J. 446, 663 A.2d 1354.

Waiver of hearing. *Ensslin v. Township of North Bergen*, 275 N.J.Super. 352, 646 A.2d 452 (A.D.1994), certification denied 142 N.J. 446, 663 A.2d 1354.

Departmental hearing required within thirty days of preliminary notice of disciplinary action. *Ensslin v. Township of North Bergen*, 275 N.J.Super. 352, 646 A.2d 452 (A.D.1994), certification denied 142 N.J. 446, 663 A.2d 1354.

Due process rights of corrections officers who were dismissed for failure to comply with mandatory drug test order were violated. *Caldwell v. New Jersey Dept. of Corrections*, 250 N.J.Super. 592, 595 A.2d 1118 (A.D.1991), certification denied 127 N.J. 555, 606 A.2d 367.

Lack of entitlement to post termination hearing. *Grexa v. State*, 168 N.J.Super. 202, 402 A.2d 938 (App.Div.1978).

Due process: right to post termination hearing (statutory). *Nicoletta v. No. Jersey District Water Supply Commission*, 77 N.J. 145, 390 A.2d 90 (1978). Concurring and dissenting opinions.

Right to hearing. *Cunningham v. Dept. of Civil Service*, 69 N.J. 13, 350 A.2d 58 (1975).

Hearing de novo on appeal to Merit System Board corrected alleged inadequate notice. *Coley v. Rowan College*, 94 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 4.

Absence of timely hearing required dismissal of disciplinary charges. *Marjarum v. Hamilton Township Division of Police*, 93 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 143.

Failure to comply with appropriate regulations in seeking to discipline employee. *Hamilton v. Camden Housing Authority*, 93 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 85.

Failure to provide employee with notice of dismissal; acts following meeting were not void pursuant to N.J.S.A. 10:4-15. *McManus v. Housing Authority of the City of Englewood*, 92 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 747.

Preliminary notice of disciplinary action met minimum discovery requirements. N.J.S.A. 40A:14-147, 11A:2-13. *Gabbianelli v. Monroe Township Police Department*, 91 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 79.

#### 4A:2-2.6 Hearings before the appointing authority

(a) The hearing shall be held before the appointing authority or its designated representative.

(b) The employee may be represented by an attorney or authorized union representative.

(c) The parties shall have the opportunity to review the evidence supporting the charges and present and examine witnesses. The employee shall not be required to testify, but an employee who does testify will be subject to cross-examination.

(d) Within 20 days of the hearing, or such additional time as agreed to by the parties, the appointing authority shall make a decision on the charges and furnish the employee either by personal service or certified mail with a Final Notice of Disciplinary Action.

#### Case Notes

Due process. *Carr v. Sharp*, C.A., 454 F.2d 271 (1971).

Requirement of exhaustion of administrative remedies. *City of New Brunswick v. Speights*, 157 N.J.Super. 9, 384 A.2d 225 (Co.1978).

Res judicata: delay in hearing: limits on de novo hearing. In re *Darcy*, 114 N.J.Super. 454, 277 A.2d 226 (1971).

Receipt of second copy of final notice of disciplinary action did not extend time for filing appeal. *Russ v. Human Services Department*, 95 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 647.

Public employee voluntarily and deliberately planned his nonappearance at hearing and was not entitled to further hearing. *Cue v. Camden County*, 92 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 131.

#### 4A:2-2.7 Actions involving criminal matters

(a) When an appointing authority suspends an employee based on a pending criminal complaint or indictment, the employee must be served with a Preliminary Notice of Disciplinary Action. The notice should include a statement that N.J.S.A. 2C:51-2 may apply to the employee, and that the employee may choose to consult with an attorney concerning the provisions of that statute.

1. The employee may request a departmental hearing within five days of receipt of the Notice. If no request is made within this time, or such additional time as agreed to by the appointing authority or as provided in a negotiated agreement, the appointing authority may then issue a Final Notice of Disciplinary Action under (a)3 below. A hearing shall be limited to the issue of whether the public interest would best be served by suspending the employee until disposition of the criminal complaint or indictment. The standard for determining that issue shall be whether the employee is unfit for duty or is a hazard to any person if

permitted to remain on the job, or that an immediate suspension is necessary to maintain safety, health, order or effective direction of public services.

2. The appointing authority may impose an indefinite suspension to extend beyond six months where an employee is subject to criminal charges as set forth in N.J.A.C. 4A:2-2.5(a)2, but not beyond the disposition of the criminal complaint or indictment.

i. Where an employee who has been indefinitely suspended enters Pre-Trial Intervention (PTI) or has received a conditional discharge, the criminal complaint or indictment shall not be deemed disposed of until completion of PTI or until dismissal of the charges due to the employee's satisfaction of the conditions in a conditional discharge, as the case may be.

ii. An appointing authority may continue an indefinite suspension until completion of PTI or until satisfaction of the conditions imposed in a conditional discharge. If an appointing authority chooses not to continue an indefinite suspension during the PTI period or during the period of conditional discharge, it may restore the employee to employment or initiate disciplinary action against the employee.

3. Where the appointing authority determines that an indefinite suspension should be imposed, a Final Notice of Disciplinary Action shall be issued stating that the employee has been indefinitely suspended pending disposition of the criminal complaint or indictment.

(b) When a court has entered an order of forfeiture pursuant to N.J.S.A. 2C:51-2, the appointing authority shall notify the employee in writing of the forfeiture and record the forfeiture in the employee's personnel records. The appointing authority shall also forward a copy of this notification to the Department of Personnel.

1. If the criminal action does not result in an order of forfeiture issued by the court pursuant to N.J.S.A. 2C:51-2, the appointing authority shall issue a second Preliminary Notice of Disciplinary Action specifying any remaining charges against the employee upon final disposition of the criminal complaint or indictment. The appointing authority shall then proceed under N.J.A.C. 4A:2-2.5 and 2.6.

(c) Where an employee has pled guilty or been convicted of a crime or offense which is cause for forfeiture of employment under N.J.S.A. 2C:51-2 but the court has not entered an order of forfeiture, the appointing authority may seek forfeiture by applying to the court for an order of forfeiture. The appointing authority shall not hold a departmental hearing regarding the issue of the applicability of N.J.S.A. 2C:51-2. If the court declines to enter an order of forfeiture in response to the appointing authority's application, the appointing authority may hold a departmental hearing regarding other disciplinary charges, if any, as provided in (b)1 above.

(c) Before interest is applied, an award of back pay shall be reduced in accordance with N.J.A.C. 4A:2-2.10(d)2 and 3.

Administrative Correction.  
See: 26 N.J.R. 198(a).

**4A:2-2.12 Counsel fees**

(a) The Merit System Board shall award partial or full reasonable counsel fees incurred in proceedings before it and incurred in major disciplinary proceedings at the departmental level where an employee has prevailed on all or substantially all of the primary issues before the Board.

(b) When the Board awards counsel fees, the actual amount shall be settled by the parties whenever possible.

(c) Subject to the provisions of (d) and (e) below, the following fee ranges shall apply in determining counsel fees:

1. Associate in a law firm: \$100.00 to \$150.00 per hour;
2. Partner or equivalent in a law firm with fewer than 15 years of experience in the practice of law: \$150.00 to \$175.00 per hour; or
3. Partner or equivalent in a law firm with 15 or more years of experience in the practice of law, or, notwithstanding the number of years of experience, with a practice concentrated in employment or labor law: \$175.00 to \$200.00 per hour.

(d) If an attorney has signed a specific fee agreement with the employee or employee's negotiations representative, the attorney shall disclose the agreement to the appointing authority. The fee ranges set forth in (c) above may be adjusted if the attorney has signed such an agreement, provided that the attorney shall not be entitled to a greater rate than that set forth in the agreement.

(e) A fee amount may also be determined or the fee ranges in (c) above adjusted based on the circumstances of a particular matter, in which case the following factors (see the Rules of Professional Conduct of the New Jersey Court Rules, at RPC 1.5(a)) shall be considered:

1. The time and labor required, the novelty and difficulty of the questions involved, and the skill requisite to perform the legal service properly;
2. The fee customarily charged in the locality for similar legal services, applicable at the time the fee is calculated;
3. The nature and length of the professional relationship with the employee; and
4. The experience, reputation and ability of the attorney performing the services.

(f) Counsel fees incurred in matters at the departmental level that do not reach the Merit System Board on appeal or are incurred in furtherance of appellate court review shall not be awarded by the Board.

(g) Reasonable out-of-pocket costs shall be awarded, including, but not limited to, costs associated with expert and subpoena fees and out-of-State travel expenses. Costs associated with normal office overhead shall not be awarded.

(h) The attorney shall submit an affidavit and any other documentation to the appointing authority.

(i) If settlement on an amount cannot be reached, either party may request, in writing, Board review.

Amended by R.2001 d.424, effective November 19, 2001.

See: 33 N.J.R. 2725(a), 33 N.J.R. 3280(a), 33 N.J.R. 3895(a).

Rewrote (a) and (c); added new (d) through (g), and recodified existing (d) and (e) as (h) and (i).

**Case Notes**

Merit System Board had the statutory authority to make an award to township police officer for counsel fees incurred in connection with police department hearing which had preceded officer's appeal to the Merit System Board, regarding officer's claim for reinstatement; the departmental hearing was an integral part of the civil service process. *Burris v. Police Department, Township of West Orange*, 769 A.2d 1112 (2001).

Regulation mandating the award of counsel fees was intended to apply in cases where disciplinary charges did not arise out of employee's lawful exercise of powers in furtherance of official duties. *Marjaram v. Township of Hamilton*, 336 N.J.Super. 85 (A.D. 2001).

Statute and its accompanying regulation, allowing Merit System Board to award fees to employee who has prevailed on all or substantially all of the primary issues, authorized fee award to police officer. *Oches v. Township of Middletown Police Dept.*, 155 N.J. 1, 713 A.2d 993 (N.J. 1998).

Municipal employee whose removal was mitigated to six-month suspension by Merit System Board was not entitled to award of counsel fees as prevailing party under regulation. *Walcott v. City of Plainfield*, 282 N.J.Super. 121, 659 A.2d 532 (A.D.1995).

Charge of possession of controlled, dangerous substance was not supported by credible evidence and required public employee's reinstatement after removal. *Ramos v. Department of Corrections*, 95 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 413.

Removal of plant operator not justified; charges against him were indefinite and inconsistent with job requirements. *Onori v. City of Burlington Department of Public Works*, 95 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 53.

Police officer was entitled to reimbursement of the expenses of his defense when allegations against the officer were dismissed. *Black v. Lakehurst Borough Police Department*, 94 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 35.

Reasonable and partial attorney fee award. *Gill v. State Dept. of Health*. 92 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 142.

Reprimand and ten days' suspension would be reversed and attorney fees would be awarded. *Neal v. Police Dept., City of New Brunswick*, 92 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 52.

Officer was entitled to unmitigated back pay but was not entitled to attorney fees or interest. N.J.S.A. 11A:11-5. *Franklin v. City of Atlantic City*, 91 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 71.

Appellant, removed from employment and later reinstated with back pay, denied counsel fees; appellant entitled to award of 30 vacation

days (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-5.6). *Harrington v. Dep't. of Human Services*, 11 N.J.A.R. 537 (1989).

APPENDIX

New Jersey Department of Personnel—Division of Merit System Practices and Labor Relations

MAJOR DISCIPLINARY APPEAL FORM

Use this form to submit an appeal of a major disciplinary action to the Merit System Board.

1. Your Name: \_\_\_\_\_  
Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Daytime Telephone: \_\_\_\_\_

(City) (State) (Zip Code)

2. Will you be represented by a lawyer or union representative at the hearing?  Yes  No

If yes, complete Section 2.

Representative Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Union or Law Firm: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Telephone: \_\_\_\_\_

(City) (State) (Zip Code)

3. Give a copy of this form and attachments to your Personnel Officer

Personnel Officer's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Telephone: \_\_\_\_\_

(City) (State) (Zip Code)

4. \_\_\_\_\_ (Date)

(Your or your representative's signature)

NOTE: Your appeal will NOT be processed unless Sections 1-4 are completed and the first two documents listed in Section 5 are included. Failure to submit all required information within 20 days after you receive the Final Notice of Disciplinary Action may result in a reduced back pay award.

5. ATTACH the following to this form:

- Preliminary Notice of Disciplinary Action.
- Final Notice of Disciplinary Action.
- A statement of the reason(s) for the appeal and the requested relief (optional).

Mail to: Merit System Board  
Department of Personnel  
Hearings Unit—Unit H  
PO Box 312  
Trenton, NJ 08625-0312

Hand Delivery: 3 Station Plaza  
44 South Clinton Avenue, Trenton

New Rule, R.1998 d.518, effective November 2, 1998.  
See: 30 N.J.R. 2325(a), 30 N.J.R. 3935(a).

(b) A grievance is an employee complaint regarding any term or condition which is beyond the employee's control and is remedial by management.

(c) The causes for minor disciplinary actions shall be the same as for major disciplinary actions. See N.J.A.C. 4A:2-2.3.

(d) This subchapter shall not apply to local service, where an appointing authority may establish procedures for processing minor discipline and grievances.

(e) In State service, this subchapter shall only apply to:

SUBCHAPTER 3. MINOR DISCIPLINE AND GRIEVANCES

4A:2-3.1 General provisions

(a) Minor discipline is a formal written reprimand or a suspension or fine of five working days or less.

2. Within each sub-list as provided in (a)1 above, the order of names shall be:

- i. Eligibles entitled to disabled veterans preference in order of their scores;
- ii. Eligibles entitled to veterans preference in order of their scores; and
- iii. Non-veteran eligibles in order of their scores.

3. Eligibles who receive the same score shall have the same rank. See N.J.A.C. 4A:4-4.2(c).

4. See N.J.A.C. 4A:5-21 for examples on use of open competitive list.

(b) Eligibles on a promotional list shall appear in the order of their scores.

1. When scores are tied, veterans shall be listed first within each rank. See N.J.A.C. 4A:4-4.2(c).

2. See N.J.A.C. 4A:5-2.2 for examples on use of a promotional list.

(c) Eligibles on special reemployment lists shall be ranked in descending order of the class code or class level of the title from which the eligible was displaced. Within each class code or class level, eligibles shall be ranked in accordance with N.J.A.C. 4A:8-2.3(c)1.

**EXAMPLE:** Emily is a State employee, and was displaced in the layoff process from her permanent title of Administrative Analyst 1, which has a class code of 29. She has a total of 10 years of seniority. George is also a State employee, and was displaced in the layoff process from his permanent title of Administrative Analyst 2, which has a class code of 26. He has a total of 15 years of seniority. The names of both Emily and George are placed on the special reemployment list for the title of Administrative Analyst 3, since it is a lower, related title. Emily's name will be listed first, because the class code of the title from which she was displaced is higher than the class code of the title from which George was displaced.

**EXAMPLE:** Robert, a municipal employee, was displaced in the layoff process from his permanent title of Supervising Maintenance Repairer, the highest class level title in his title series. He has 15 years of service with the municipality. Angela, who was permanent in the title of Assistant Supervising Maintenance Repairer when she was displaced in the layoff process, has 16 and one-half years of service with the municipality. The names of both Robert and Angela will be placed at the head of special reemployment lists for Senior Maintenance Repairer and Maintenance Repairer. On both of these lists, Robert's name will appear first and Angela's second, since Robert was displaced from a higher class level title.

(d) Eligibles on regular or police and fire reemployment lists shall be ranked in the order of seniority in the perma-

nent title from which they resigned, retired or were voluntarily demoted, with the name of the person with the greatest seniority appearing first on the list.

(e) It shall be the responsibility of an eligible to keep a current address on file with the Department of Personnel.

Amended by R.1993 d.270, effective June 7, 1993.

See: 25 N.J.R. 1085(b), 25 N.J.R. 2509(a).

Revised (a).

Amended by R.1997 d.71, effective February 18, 1997.

See: 28 N.J.R. 4979(a), 29 N.J.R. 549(b).

Substantially amended (c).

Amended by R.2000 d.12, effective January 3, 2000.

See: 31 N.J.R. 2827(a), 32 N.J.R. 39(a).

In (c), substituted "accordance with N.J.A.C. 4A:8-2.3(c)1" for "order of seniority. See N.J.A.C. 4A:8-2.4" at the end.

#### Case Notes

Credit towards service in other governmental entity. *Kloss v. Parsippany-Troy Hills*, 170 N.J.Super. 153, 406 A.2d 170 (App.Div.1979).

Order of appointment. *State v. State Supervisory Employees Association*, 78 N.J. 54, 393 A.2d 233 (1978).

#### 4A:4-3.3 Duration and cancellation of eligible lists

(a) Open competitive and promotional lists shall be promulgated for three years from the date of their establishment, unless the Commissioner determines that, under the circumstances, a shorter time period is appropriate.

1. An eligible list may, for good cause, be extended by the Commissioner prior to its expiration date, except that no list shall have a duration of more than four years.

2. The name of any employee shall not remain on a regular reemployment list for more than three years from the date of resignation, except as provided in (a)1 above.

3. Special reemployment, police reemployment and fire reemployment lists shall have unlimited durations.

(b) The Commissioner may, in cases of fraud, illegality, test invalidity, error by the Department or other good cause, cancel an eligible list prior to its expiration date by issuing an order, which shall provide a means for the notification of eligibles. The Commissioner shall also provide a copy of this order to affected appointing authorities.

(c) See N.J.A.C. 4A:4-4.9 for appointments after the expiration date of the eligible list.

Amended by R.1996 d.98, effective February 20, 1996.

See: 27 N.J.R. 4049(a), 28 N.J.R. 1201(b).

Added (c).

Amended by R.1997 d.410, effective October 6, 1997.

See: 29 N.J.R. 2732(a), 29 N.J.R. 4279(a).

In (b), substituted "an order, which . . . affected appointing authorities" for "a public notice and entering such notice in the minutes of the Merit System Board".

#### Case Notes

Employment applicants who were tested and appointed to hiring eligibility list for position of municipal fire fighter did not have protect-

ed property interest in their ranking. Newark Branch, N.A.A.C.P. v. Town of Harrison, N.J., C.A.3 (N.J.)1991, 940 F.2d 792.

Power of Commission to extend local eligibility list. Malone v. Fender, 158 N.J.Super. 190, 385 A.2d 929 (App.Div.1978) supplemented 160 N.J.Super. 221, 389 A.2d 504, reversed 80 N.J. 129, 402 A.2d 240 (1979).

Statutory 3 year limit upheld (local service). Imbriacco v. State Civil Service Commission, 150 N.J.Super. 105, 374 A.2d 1251 (App.Div. 1977).

Life of promotion list could not be extended beyond three-year limit (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-11.6). In the Matter of Newark Police Sergeant and Lieutenant List for Dep't of Civil Service, 149 N.J.Super. 121, 373 A.2d 422 (App.Div.1977).

#### 4A:4-3.4 Revival of eligible lists

(a) The Commissioner may revive an expired eligible list under the following circumstances:

1. To implement a court order, in a suit filed prior to the expiration of the list;
2. To implement an order of the Commissioner or Board in an appeal or proceeding instituted during the life of the list;
3. To correct an administrative error;
4. To effect the appointment of an eligible whose working test period was terminated by a layoff; or
5. For other good cause.

Amended by R.1989 d.570, effective November 6, 1989.  
See: 21 N.J.R. 2429(a), 21 N.J.R. 3451(a).

In (a): deleted "or" between 3 and 4. Added new 4 and relettered old 4 as new 5.

#### 4A:4-3.5 Consolidation of eligible lists

(a) The Commissioner may consolidate successive eligible lists for a given title which result from successive open competitive or promotional examinations by one or more of the following methods:

1. Placing the first name on the later list after the last name of the prior list;
2. Supplementing an incomplete list with an eligible list for an appropriate title; or
3. Combining of names of eligibles by scores.

(b) When eligible lists are consolidated, the part of the eligible list which was promulgated first shall not continue beyond its expiration date.

#### 4A:4-3.6 Additions to eligible lists

(a) The Commissioner may add names to an eligible list at any time during the life of the list under the following circumstances:

1. A make-up examination has been given and a candidate has received a passing score;

2. To correct an error by the Department of Personnel;
3. To implement an appeal decision; or
4. Where a third party, such as a college or the Veterans Administration, has submitted documents to correct an administrative error.

(b) When the name of an eligible is added to an existing list to correct an error made by the Department of Personnel, the Department shall determine the retroactive certification and/or appointment rights. When the name of an eligible is added to an existing list for any other reason, the Commissioner shall determine the effect of the action on certifications and prior permanent appointments. See also N.J.A.C. 4A:4-1.4 for conditional regular appointments.

#### Case Notes

Improper deletion of applicant's name from list of persons eligible for resident's preference for appointment to city police department applicant would not warrant award of mandated appointment and back pay. Nunan v. New Jersey Dept. of Personnel, 244 N.J.Super. 494, 582 A.2d 1266 (A.D.1990).

#### 4A:4-3.7 Priority of eligible lists

(a) When there is more than one current eligible list for a title, the priority of the lists shall be as follows:

1. Special reemployment, when the available position/title is in the department or autonomous agency from which the eligible was laid off, laterally displaced or demoted in lieu of layoff;
2. Promotional;
3. Special reemployment, when the available position/title is located in a department or autonomous agency other than that from which the eligible was laid off, laterally displaced or demoted in lieu of layoff;
4. Regular reemployment, police or fire reemployment; and
5. Open competitive.

(b) Reinstatement of a permanent employee following disability retirement shall have priority over appointment from any eligible list, except a special reemployment list. See N.J.A.C. 4A:4-7.12.

(c) The existence of an open competitive or promotional list in a jurisdiction receiving an employee in an intergovernmental transfer in accordance with N.J.A.C. 4A:4-7.1A shall not be a bar to such transfer.

(d) Reemployment of certain law enforcement officers and firefighters pursuant to the provisions of N.J.A.C. 4A:4-3.9 and 4A:4-3.10 shall have priority over appointment from any eligible list, except a special reemployment list.

(e) For purposes of this section, an autonomous agency in local service is one which, by statute, is a body corporate and has the powers of an appointing authority. In State service, an autonomous agency is one which, by law, is in but not under the supervision of a principal department.

Amended by R.1992 d.338, effective September 8, 1992.

See: 24 N.J.R. 2107(a), 24 N.J.R. 3091(b).

Added (h).

Amended by R.1993 d.270, effective June 7, 1993.

See: 25 N.J.R. 1085(b), 25 N.J.R. 2509(a).

Revised (a)1 and 3; added new (c).

Amended by R.1996 d.471, effective October 7, 1996.

See: 28 N.J.R. 3208(a), 28 N.J.R. 4423(a).

Gave reemployment under 4A:4-3.9 and 3.10 priority over any eligible lists except special reemployment lists.

Amended by R.2001 d.420, effective November 19, 2001.

See: 33 N.J.R. 2567(a), 33 N.J.R. 3895(b).

Added (e); recodified former (c) and (d) as (d) and (e).

#### 4A:4-3.8 Correction of errors

(a) The Department may correct an error at any time during the life of an eligible list.

(b) The Commissioner shall determine whether such correction shall affect any prior appointments or certifications.

(c) Corrections of errors may result in a change in ranking. See N.J.A.C. 4A:4-3.6.

#### Case Notes

Improper deletion of applicant's name from list of persons eligible for resident's preference for appointment to city police department applicant would warrant award of mandated appointment and back pay. *Nunan v. New Jersey Dept. of Personnel*, 244 N.J.Super. 494, 582 A.2d 1266 (A.D.1990).

#### 4A:4-3.9 Reemployment program for certain law enforcement officers and firefighters

(a) A municipality or a county which has established a police department as described in N.J.S.A. 40A:14-180 may appoint any person to an entry level title in the police department who has:

- i. Whether the list can be certified to another appointing authority;
- ii. The recommendation of the employee's former appointing authority; and
- iii. Any other relevant factors.

2. Any employee who has been removed for disciplinary reasons shall not be restored to an eligible list.

3. Any employee who has filed an appeal pursuant to N.J.A.C. 4A:2-4 shall have his or her request for restoration held in abeyance pending the appeal.

(b) An employee who is laid off during the working test period shall be restored to the eligible list from which he or she was appointed.

(c) A permanent employee serving a working test period in another title shall continue to accrue seniority in his or her permanent title for the duration of the working test period. See N.J.A.C. 4A:4-1.9 for procedures on restoration to a former title.

Amended by R.1989 d.570, effective November 6, 1989.  
See: 21 N.J.R. 2429(a), 21 N.J.R. 3451(a).

Added new (b) and relettered old (b) as new (c).  
Amended by R.1990 d.553, effective November 19, 1990.  
See: 22 N.J.R. 2629(a), 22 N.J.R. 3482(b).

Provision insures that permanent employee accrues seniority in permanent title during working test period in another title.

## SUBCHAPTER 6. EXAMINATION AND SELECTION DISQUALIFICATION AND APPEALS

### 4A:4-6.1 Examination and selection disqualification

(a) A person may be denied examination eligibility or appointment when he or she:

1. Lacks the job requirements;
2. Is ineligible, by law, for employment in the title;
3. Is physically or psychologically unfit to perform effectively the duties of the title. However, an injury incurred in the armed forces shall not be considered a disqualification unless the Commissioner considers the condition incapacitating;
4. Has failed to pass examination procedures;
5. Has been removed from the public service for disciplinary reasons after an opportunity for a hearing;
6. Has made a false statement of any material fact or attempted any deception or fraud in any part of the selection or appointment process;
7. Has a prior employment history which relates adversely to the title; or

8. Has failed to pay the required application processing fee in a timely manner, or for open competitive examination, has failed to provide documentation of exemption from the application processing fee in a timely manner; or

9. Other sufficient reasons.

(b) Except where precluded by law, a person who is disqualified pursuant to (a)5 and 7 above may, for good cause, be admitted to an examination and, with the appointing authority's concurrence, certified for appointment.

(c) Any action specified in this section shall be effective upon receipt of written notice of disqualification.

Amended by R.1993 d.270, effective June 7, 1993.

See: 25 N.J.R. 1085(b), 25 N.J.R. 2509(a).

Added new (a)8; redesignated (a)8 to (a)9.

#### Law Review and Journal Commentaries

Arrests—Civil Service—Police. Judith Nallin, 133 N.J.L.J. No. 6, 57 (1993).

#### Case Notes

Arrest justifies removal of applicant's name from eligibility list where circumstances surrounding arrest adversely relate to the employment sought, and agency must state specifically its reasons for removal. *Tharpe v. City of Newark Police Dept.*, 261 N.J.Super. 401, 619 A.2d 228 (A.D.1992).

Remand was required where administrative record from Merit System Board did not disclose basis for Board's equation of police officer candidate's personality traits with finding that candidate was mentally unfit. *Matter of Vey*, 124 N.J. 534, 591 A.2d 1333 (1991).

Removal of provisional juvenile detention officer from eligible list because of prior employment history was improper without hearing by Merit System Board. *Matter of Wiggins*, 242 N.J.Super. 342, 576 A.2d 932 (A.D.1990).

Modification of removal to resignation in good standing was warranted where employee underwent successful rehabilitation after arrest on drug charges. *Beachum v. Vineland City Board of Education*, 96 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 312.

Fact that drug screening guidelines were not strictly followed during unannounced screening did not require removal of positive test result from state police recruit's record. In the *Matter of the Appeal of Wayne Paterno*, 96 N.J.A.R.2d (POL) 5.

Removal of dismissed provisional police officer's name from eligibility list was justified by poor past performance. *Grafje v. Hudson County Sheriff*, 95 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 476.

Advanced information about contents of promotional examination disqualified public employee from eligibility for promotion. *Motiani v. State Department of Transportation*, 95 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 121.

Removal of assistant engineer traffic's name from list for senior engineer traffic appropriate; employee attempted to get knowledge about examination. *Motiani v. State Department of Transportation*, 95 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 121.

Removal from eligibility list for fire lieutenant not warranted. *Brown v. City of Gloucester*, 93 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 464.

History of erratic emotional instability warranted removal of applicant's name from eligible list for family service specialist position. *Calhoun v. Division of Youth and Family Services*, 93 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 268.

County was justified in removing applicant's name from open competitive list. *Strasser v. Camden County*, 92 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 497.

#### 4A:4-6.2 Actions against disqualified persons

(a) A disqualification under N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.1 may result in:

1. Rejection of examination application;
2. Refusal to test an individual;
3. Refusal to place a candidate's name on an eligible list;
4. Refusal to certify an eligible's name;
5. Removal of an eligible's name from the eligible list;
6. Removal from employment; or
7. Other appropriate action.

(b) Major disciplinary procedures shall be applicable to removal of an employee who is permanent or serving in a working test period.

#### Case Notes

Remand was required where record did not disclose basis for agency's equation of police officer candidate's personality traits with finding that candidate was mentally unfit. *Matter of Vey*, 124 N.J. 534, 591 A.2d 1333 (1991).

Process servers have no statutory right to tenure (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-8.14). *New Jersey District Court Assoc., Inc., v. New Jersey Superior Court*, 205 N.J.Super. 582, 501 A.2d 596 (App.Div.1985) affirmed 208 N.J.Super. 527, 506 A.2d 742 (1986), certification denied 104 N.J. 386, 517 A.2d 393, certiorari denied 107 S.Ct. 1289, 479 U.S. 1086, 94 L.Ed.2d 146.

Absent contractual, statutory or implied right to continued employment, employment termination invokes no substantive due process protection of a property interest (citing former rule N.J.A.C. 4:1-8.14). *N.J. District Court Associates, Inc., v. N.J. Superior Court*, 205 N.J.Super. 582, 501 A.2d 596 (Law Div.1985) affirmed 209 N.J.Super. 527, 506 A.2d 742 (App.Div.1986), certification denied 104 N.J. 386, 517 A.2d 393, certiorari denied 107 S.Ct. 1289, 479 U.S. 1086, 94 L.Ed.2d 146.

Interest in liberty protected by due process clause; right to post-termination evidentiary hearing (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-8.14). *Campbell v. Atlantic Cty. Bd. of Freeholders*, 145 N.J.Super. 316, 367 A.2d 912 (Law.Div.1976) affirmed per curiam 158 N.J.Super. 14, 385 A.2d 311 (App.Div.1978).

Appellant suspended and subsequently removed from title of Senior Systems Analyst reinstated to duties appropriate to his permanent title; appointing authority failed to support charges of falsifying residency address, falsely signing affidavit with intent to defraud county and failing to complete assignments timely and correctly (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-6.4). *Valluzzi v. Bergen County*, 10 N.J.A.R. 89 (1988), adopted—*Merit System Bd., App.Div. A-3269-87*, 3/3/88.

Discretion of Bd. of Trustees to refund contributions to pension fund after employee was dismissed for delinquent performance of his duties. Refund granted (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-8.14). *Maddox v. Bd. of Trustees*, 2 N.J.A.R. 372 (1980).

#### 4A:4-6.3 Examination and selection appeals

(a) Appeals may be made on:

1. Examination items, scoring and administration (see N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.4);
2. Disqualification for medical or psychological reasons (see N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.5); and
3. Examination related matters other than (a)1 and (a)2 above (see N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.6) including:
  - i. Disqualifications under N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.1;
  - ii. List extension or revival; and
  - iii. Denial of veterans preference for a particular examination.

(b) The appellant shall have the burden of proof, except for medical or psychological disqualification appeals, where the appointing authority shall have the burden of proof.

(c) Unless ordered by the Commissioner, the filing of an appeal shall not affect the promulgation of a list, a certification or an appointment. See N.J.A.C. 4A:4-1.4 for conditional appointments.

(d) A person who has filed an appeal concerning an examination disqualification may, where appropriate, be admitted to the examination. However, the person's examination results will not be processed while the review is pending.

(e) All appeals shall be in writing and include the examination title and symbol number where appropriate, the action being appealed, the specific objections and requested relief.

(f) A party to an appeal must serve copies of all materials on every other party.

Amended by R.1989 d.569, effective November 6, 1989.  
See: 21 N.J.R. 1766(a), 21 N.J.R. 3448(b).

In (a)1: Made stylistic revisions.

Amended by R.2006 d.104, effective March 20, 2006.

See: 37 N.J.R. 4351(a), 38 N.J.R. 1425(a).

In (a)3iii, added "for a particular examination."

#### Case Notes

Merit System Board bears burden of establishing job-validity of its psychological tests. *Matter of Vey*, 124 N.J. 534, 591 A.2d 1333 (1991).

Appointing authority has discretion under "rule of three" statute to appoint any of top three candidates while statute mandating preference for residents in the event of tie scores were pertinent in placing three people on list (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-9.6; 4:2-9.1; 4:3-9.1). *Gallagher v. Irvington*, 190 N.J.Super. 394, 463 A.2d 969 (App.Div.1983).

Claim of failure to promote due to anti-union animus. *City of Hackensack v. Winner*, 162 N.J.Super. 1, 392 A.2d 187 (App.Div.1978). Modified and affirmed 82 N.J. 1, 410 A.2d 1146 (1980).

Jurisdiction, Civil Service Commission and PERC. *City of Hackensack v. Winner*, 162 N.J.Super. 1, 392 A.2d 187 (App.Div.1978) modified 82 N.J. 1, 410 A.2d 1146.

#### 4A:4-6.4 Review of examination items, scoring and administration

(a) No later than five business days after the examination has been held, candidates for multiple choice examinations

ii. Both parties may file written exceptions with the Merit System Board within 10 days of receipt of the report and cross-exceptions within five days.

4. In appropriate cases, the Merit System Board may refer an appellant for an independent professional evaluation.

5. The Merit System Board may assess costs and penalties against a party when the inadequacy of a professional report necessitates an independent professional evaluation, when a party causes unnecessary delay in the review process, or for other substantial violation of these rules.

(h) The Merit System Board shall review the appeal, including the written report and exceptions, if any, and render a written final decision.

Repeal and New Rule, R.1989 d.569, effective November 6, 1989.

See: 21 N.J.R. 1766(a), 21 N.J.R. 3448(b).

Amended by R.1990 d.346, effective July 16, 1990.

See: 22 N.J.R. 1300(a), 22 N.J.R. 2143(a).

Changes made to accurately reflect N.J.S.A. 45:14B-1 et seq. concerning the licensing of psychologists.

Amended by R.1993 d.46, effective January 19, 1993.

See: 24 N.J.R. 3596(a), 25 N.J.R. 292(a).

Redesignated existing (b)-(g) as (c)-(h); added new (b).

Amended by R.1993 d.270, effective June 7, 1993.

See: 25 N.J.R. 1085(b), 25 N.J.R. 2509(a).

Revised (a)2 and (e).

Amended by R.2006 d.104, effective March 20, 2006.

See: 37 N.J.R. 4351(a), 38 N.J.R. 1425(a).

Rewrote (d)1; deleted former (d)2; recodified former (d)3 as (d)2.

#### Law Review and Journal Commentaries

Public Employment—Police. Steven P. Bann, 136 N.J.L.J. No. 14, 70 (1994).

#### Case Notes

Remand was required where record did not disclose basis for agency's equation of police officer candidate's personality traits with finding that candidate was mentally unfit. *Matter of Vey*, 124 N.J. 534, 591 A.2d 1333 (1991).

Applicant found to be psychologically unfit for real estate analyst position properly removed from certified list for such position. *Cooper v. Department of Community Affairs*, 96 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 255.

#### 4A:4-6.6 Disqualification appeals

(a) Appeals other than scoring, item and administration appeals (N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.4) and medical and/or psychological disqualification appeals (N.J.A.C. 4A:4-6.5) shall follow the following procedures:

1. The appeal shall be filed within 20 days of notice of the action, decision or situation being appealed.

2. An appeal must be filed with the Department of Personnel as indicated on the notice advising of disqualification.

(b) The Merit System Board shall decide any appeal on the written record or such other proceeding as the Board deems appropriate.

Amended by R.1989 d.569, effective November 6, 1989.

See: 21 N.J.R. 1766(a), 21 N.J.R. 3448(b).

In (a); added "and administration" and replaced "unfitness" with "disqualification" describing types of appeals.

Amended by R.1993 d.162, effective April 5, 1993.

See: 24 N.J.R. 4467(a), 25 N.J.R. 1511(b).

Revised (a); deleted existing (b); redesignated existing (c)-(d) to (b)-(c) with revisions in text.

Amended by R.1998 d.291, effective June 1, 1998.

See: 30 N.J.R. 890(a), 30 N.J.R. 1975(a).

Deleted (a)3; deleted (b) and (c); and recodified former (b)2 as (b).

#### Case Notes

Department of Personnel did not sufficiently disclose basis for its grading decision on police sergeant's civil service examination to satisfy due process or to provide for meaningful appellate review. *Brady v. Department of Personnel*, 289 N.J.Super. 557, 674 A.2d 616 (A.D.1996).

Statements made in report of background check of police officer applicant were absolutely privileged. *Pollinger v. Loigman*, 256 N.J.Super. 257, 606 A.2d 1113 (A.D.1992).

### SUBCHAPTER 7. OTHER APPOINTMENTS OR EMPLOYEE MOVEMENTS

#### 4A:4-7.1 Transfers within the same governmental jurisdiction

(a) A permanent transfer is the movement of a permanent employee between organizational units within the same governmental jurisdiction.

1. In State service, an organizational unit shall mean an appointing authority. The Department of Human Services shall constitute a single appointing authority for purposes of this subchapter.

2. In local service, an organizational unit shall mean a department or separate agency within the same county or municipality. A school district shall be considered a separate jurisdiction.

(b) If the transferred employee is concurrently appointed to a title other than that held on a permanent basis at the time of transfer to accurately reflect new duties, the permanent transfer shall be made in combination with appropriate promotional, lateral title change or voluntary demotion procedures. See N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.4 et seq., 4A:4-7.6 and 4A:4-7.8, respectively.

1. The employee shall retain permanent status in the previously held permanent title with the recipient organizational unit until examination and working test period procedures are concluded.

2. If the employee does not successfully complete the examination or working test period procedures, the recipient organizational unit shall return the employee to his or her permanent title within this organizational unit pursuant to N.J.A.C. 4A:4-1.9 unless the employee has been disqualified for further employment.

(c) A permanent transfer shall require the consent of both organizational units, the affected employee, and the approval of the Department of Personnel.

1. Consent may be withdrawn by any party prior to the effective date of the transfer.

2. The consent of the employee shall not be required when there is a transfer or combining of functions or operations across organizational unit lines.

(d) A temporary transfer may be voluntary or involuntary and is the movement of a permanent employee between organizational units within the same governmental jurisdiction for a maximum of six months to effect economies, make available a needed service for short periods or for any other documented purpose which is in the best interest of the public service. All temporary transfers must be approved by the Commissioner of the Department of Personnel.

(e) An emergency transfer may be voluntary or involuntary and is the movement of a permanent employee between organizational units within the same governmental jurisdiction for a maximum of 30 days.

1. The Commissioner may authorize an emergency transfer when the appointing authority for the receiving unit certifies that the failure to make such transfer will result in harm to persons or property.

2. If there is a need to extend the emergency transfer beyond 30 days, the procedures governing temporary transfers must be followed.

(f) Any affected employee must be given at least 30 days' written notice of an involuntary transfer, except an involuntary emergency transfer, in which case reasonable notice must be given.

1. The notice shall contain the following:

- i. The organizational unit to which the transfer is being made;
- ii. The effective date of the transfer; and
- iii. The reason for the transfer.

2. Less than 30 days' notice may be given where the employee gives his or her consent for a shorter notice period or the Commissioner of the Department of Personnel finds that a more immediate transfer is required to provide a needed service.

Public Notice: Petition for amendment.

See: 27 N.J.R. 2805(a).

Amended by R.1996 d.426, effective September 16, 1996.

See: 28 N.J.R. 2106(b), 28 N.J.R. 4223(a).

Added provisions relating to emergency transfers.

Amended by R.1997 d.411, effective October 6, 1997.

See: 29 N.J.R. 2732(b), 29 N.J.R. 4279(b).

In (a)1, added second sentence.

Amended by R.2001 d.420, effective November 19, 2001.

See: 33 N.J.R. 2567(a), 33 N.J.R. 3895(b).

#### Case Notes

Status of attorney as private plan hearing officer throughout the period in question rendered assignment of new supervisor not "transfer." *Morley v. State*, Dept. of Labor, 276 N.J.Super. 223, 647 A.2d 1312 (A.D.1994).

Scope of negotiation: transfer and reassignment provisions. In re *IFPTE Local 195 v. State*, 88 N.J. 393, 443 A.2d 187 (1982).

Improper transfer. *State v. Richford*, 161 N.J.Super. 165, 391 A.2d 531 (App.Div.1978).

Transfer requires change from one position to another of the same class—petitioner's change in position was not a transfer even though position was substantially similar (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-15.1 and 15.4). State Administrative Office of the Courts v. *Richford*, 161 N.J.Super. 165, 391 A.2d 531 (App.Div.1978).

Intraclass transfers. In re Appeal of *Lembo*, 151 N.J.Super. 242, 376 A.2d 971 (App.Div.1977).

Rights of employee voluntarily transferred (statutory). *Widmer v. Township of Mahwah*, 151 N.J.Super. 79, 376 A.2d 567 (App.Div.1977).

Approval from Civil Service Comm'n required prior to county board of freeholders transferring employees from classified to unclassified positions (citing former N.J.A.C. 4:1-5.4). *Bergen Cty. v. New Jersey Dep't of Civil Service*, 115 N.J.Super. 90, 278 A.2d 232 (App.Div.1971).

Transfer from classified to unclassified positions. *Bergen County v. Dept. of Civil Service of N.J.*, 115 N.J.Super. 90, 278 A.2d 232 (App.Div.1971).

#### 4A:4-7.1A Intergovernmental transfers

(a) An intergovernmental transfer is the movement of a permanent employee between governmental jurisdictions operating under Title 11A, New Jersey Statutes, or the appointment of an employee, by a governmental jurisdiction operating under Title 11A, within 90 days of the effective date of a layoff for reasons of economy or efficiency in which the employee is separated from service from another governmental jurisdiction operating under Title 11A.

(b) An intergovernmental transfer shall require the consent in writing of the sending jurisdiction, if any, the receiving jurisdiction and the affected employee, and the approval of the Department of Personnel.

1. The receiving jurisdiction may waive its residency ordinance or resolution in consenting to receive a transferring employee, provided, however, transferring police officers and firefighters must maintain their New Jersey residency. See N.J.S.A. 40A:14-9.8 and 40A:14-122.8.

2. The optional waiver of accumulated sick leave and seniority rights by a law enforcement officer, including a sheriff's officer and a county correction officer, shall require the consent in writing of the receiving jurisdiction, the affected employee, and the Department of Personnel.

(c) A transferred employee shall be moved to a title substantially at the same level.

(e) With the Commissioner's approval, this section may also apply to employees with permanent status in titles in the non-competitive division who take a voluntary demotion to a title in the competitive division of the career service.

(f) When an employee is returned to his or her prior permanent title after a voluntary demotion, seniority in the prior permanent title shall be aggregated when:

1. The demotion was necessary due to the temporary loss of licensure required to perform the duties of the position;
2. The demotion was agreed to by both the employee and the appointing authority; and
3. The demotion was for a set period of time up to a maximum of one year.

Amended by R.1993 d.270, effective June 7, 1993.

See: 25 N.J.R. 1085(b), 25 N.J.R. 2509(a).

Revised (b) and added (b)1; revised (c)1.

Amended by R.1994 d.74, effective February 7, 1994.

See: 25 N.J.R. 4823(b), 26 N.J.R. 795(a).

Amended by R.1996 d.259, effective June 3, 1996.

See: 28 N.J.R. 1334(a), 28 N.J.R. 2839(a).

Added (c)2.

#### Case Notes

Position and salary reduced; bad faith. *Morello v. Township of Belleville*, 94 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 606.

Demotion of personnel for reasons of economy was warranted. *Mihlebach v. New Jersey Department of Human Services*, 92 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 443.

Rescission of voluntary demotion after the demotion had been effectuated. *Loutman v. Cumberland County*, 92 N.J.A.R.2d (CSV) 262.

#### 4A:4-7.9 Resignation/new appointment

(a) A permanent employee who is appointed from an open competitive list to a title in a different organizational unit within the same governmental jurisdiction shall be considered to have resigned from the previous permanent title.

1. Accumulated service for purposes of determining sick and vacation leave, and in State service, administrative leave, entitlements shall be retained.
2. See N.J.A.C. 4A:3-4.4(b) for salary placement in State service.

(b) The employee may request placement on the regular reemployment list for the previous title.

(c) The new appointing authority shall inform the employee of his or her effective resignation of permanent status prior to the employee's new appointment.

Amended by R.1993 d.270, effective June 7, 1993.

See: 25 N.J.R. 1085(b), 25 N.J.R. 2509(a).

Added new (c).

#### 4A:4-7.10 Regular reemployment

(a) A permanent employee who has resigned in good standing, retired or voluntarily demoted, may request consideration for reemployment by indicating availability to his or her appointing authority.

(b) Upon recommendation of the appointing authority that such reemployment is in the best interest of the service, the Department of Personnel shall place the employee's name on a reemployment list. A regular reemployment list shall be subject to certification to all appointing authorities in a jurisdiction.

(c) Police and fire reemployment lists shall have unlimited durations. Regular reemployment lists for all other titles shall have durations of three years from the date of resignation, retirement or voluntary demotion, unless the list is extended pursuant to N.J.A.C. 4A:4-3.3(a)1.

1. Requests for reemployment must be submitted within the duration of the applicable list.

(d) Seniority commences as of the date of regular reemployment.

Amended by R.1992 d.338, effective September 8, 1992.

See: 24 N.J.R. 2107(a), 24 N.J.R. 3091(b).

Deleted (b); redesignated existing (c) as (b) without changes.

Petition for Rulemaking.

See: 26 N.J.R. 2148(a).

Amended by R.1995 d. 418, effective August 7, 1995.

See: 27 N.J.R. 1839(a), 27 N.J.R. 2885(b).

Redesignated former (a) as (a) and (b), in (b) substituted the Department of Personnel for the employee as the party responsible for adding the employee's name to a reemployment list, added (c), and redesignated former (b) as (d).

Amended by R.1997 d.195, effective May 19, 1997.

See: 28 N.J.R. 4980(a), 29 N.J.R. 2266(b).

In (b), added the last sentence.

Administrative correction.

See: 34 N.J.R. 2781(b).

#### Law Review and Journal Commentaries

Civil Service—Disability Retirement—Police Seniority. *Judith Nal-lin*, 133 N.J.L.J. No. 13, 55 (1993).

#### Case Notes

Aggregation of seniority complies with legislative mandate that disabled employees return to former position upon cessation of disability. *Matter of Allen*, 262 N.J.Super. 438, 621 A.2d 87 (A.D.1993).

Police officer who accepted lower position but sought former position after he overcame disability did not waive rights and was not barred by estoppel or laches. *Matter of Allen*, 262 N.J.Super. 438, 621 A.2d 87 (A.D.1993).

#### 4A:4-7.11 Transfer or combining of functions

(a) When any of the functions of a department, agency or unit of a political subdivision operating under Title 11A, New Jersey Statutes, are transferred, consolidated, unified, absorbed or combined with those of the State or of a separate political subdivision operating under Title 11A, New Jersey Statutes, the Department of Personnel upon

request of both appointing authorities shall approve the transfer of some or all affected employees to the receiving unit.

(b) Any employee so transferred who holds permanent or probationary status in a title in the career service shall continue to hold such status in the receiving unit.

(c) Seniority calculations and leave entitlements for transferred permanent or probationary employees shall be calculated as if the entire period of service was in the receiving unit.

(d) If positions are abolished because they are made no longer necessary by the consolidation of functions, affected employees shall be accorded all layoff and special reemployment rights in N.J.A.C. 4A:8.

New Rule, R.1992 d.419, effective October 19, 1992.  
See: 24 N.J.R. 2494(a), 24 N.J.R. 3718(a).

#### 4A:4-7.12 Reinstatement following disability retirement

(a) A permanent employee who has been placed on disability retirement may be reinstated following a determination from the Division of Pensions that the retiree is no longer disabled.

(b) The employee's reinstatement shall have priority over appointment from any eligible list, except a special reemployment list.

(c) Seniority for an employee who is reinstated following a period of disability retirement shall be the aggregate of permanent service in the employee's permanent title prior to retirement and following reinstatement. Seniority shall not be granted for the period of retirement.

New Rule, R.1992 d.338, effective September 8, 1992.  
See: 24 N.J.R. 2107(a), 24 N.J.R. 3091(b).

#### Cross References

Priority of eligible lists, see N.J.A.C. 4A:4-3.7.