INDEX.

	Page
Notice and Grounds of Appeal	1
Information	3
Plea	8
Order	13
Plea to Amend Information	14
Replication	19
Trial	20
Ballots Offered	35
Findings and Postea	37
Judgment	38

EXHIBIT.

Ballots.

First Ward, Sixth District	39
Second Ward, Third District	40
Second Ward, Fifth District	41
Third Ward, First District	42
Third Ward, Fifth District	44
Third Ward, Sixth District	45
Third Ward, Fifth District	46
Fifth Ward, Fourth District	47
First Ward, Second District	48
First Ward, Third District	49
First Ward, Fourth District	50
Second Ward, Second District	51
Third Ward, Second District	52
Second Ward, Third District	53
Third Ward, Fifth District	54
Third Ward, Sixth District	55
First Ward, First District	56
First Ward, Second District	58
First Ward, Third District	62
First Ward, Fourth District	68
First Ward, Fifth District	79
First Ward, Sixth District	84

New Jersey State Library

PAGE
First Ward, Seventh District 93
Second Ward, First District 98
Second Ward, Second District..... 107
Second Ward, Third District 116
Second Ward, Fourth District 124
Second Ward, Fifth District..... 137
Second Ward, Sixth District..... 142
Third Ward, First District 146
Third Ward, Second District. 149
Third Ward, Third District 152
Third Ward, Fourth District 160
Third Ward, Fifth District 166
Third Ward, Sixth District 178
Third Ward, Seventh District..... 188
Fourth Ward, First District..... 197
Fourth Ward, Second District 203
Fourth Ward, Third District..... 206
Fourth Ward, Fourth District..... 208
Fourth Ward, Fifth District 211
Fifth Ward, First Ward..... 219
Fifth Ward, Second District..... 222
Fifth Ward, Third District 233
Fifth Ward, Fourth District 238

New Jersey Supreme Court

BERT DALY,
Relator-Appellant,

vs.

PIERRE P. GARVEN,
Defendant-Respondent.

Amended Notice and Grounds of Appeal.

NOTICE AND GROUNDS OF APPEAL.

To Collins & Corbin, Attorneys of Defendant-Respondent:

Take notice, that the relator appeals to the Court of Errors and Appeals from the whole of the judgment entered in the above stated cause on the following grounds:

1. Because a portion of "A supplement to an act entitled 'An act relating to, regulating and providing for the government of cities, towns, boroughs and other municipalities within this State,' approved April 25, 1911," which said supplement was approved April 7, 1914, which provides in paragraphs 1 and 3 of section 4 that "if more than one office is to be filled vote as many first choices as there are officers to be elected or the ballot will be void * * * all ballots shall be void which do not contain first choice votes for as many candidates as there are offices to be filled" is unconstitutional and void.

2. Because the Court refused to hold that a portion of "A supplement to an act entitled 'An act

relating to, regulating and providing for the government of cities, towns, boroughs and other municipalities within this State,' approved April 25, 1911," which said supplement was approved April 7, 1914, which provides in paragraphs 1 and 3 of section 4 that "if more than one office is to be filled vote as many first choices as there are officers to be elected or the ballot will be void * * * all ballots shall be void which do not contain first-choice votes for as many candidates as there are offices to be filled" is unconstitutional and void.

3. Because the Court refused to receive in evidence certain ballots cast by duly qualified electors of the City of Bayonne at the election held in said City of Bayonne for the purpose of electing commissioners on April 13, 1915.

4. Because the Court refused to find in favor of the relator and against the defendant.

5. Because the Court found and gave verdict in favor of the defendant and against the relator.

ELMER W. DEMAREST,
Attorneys for and of Counsel
with Relator-Appellant.

Service of a copy of the within notice acknowledged this 8th day of February, 1917.

COLLINS & CORBIN,
Attorneys of Defendant-Respondent.

INFORMATION

NEW JERSEY SUPREME COURT.

BERT DALY,
Relator,
vs.
PIERRE P. GARVEN,
Defendant.

On Quo Warranto Information.

BERT DALY, of the City of Bayonne, in the the County of Hudson and State of New Jersey, a citizen of this State, who believes himself lawfully entitled to the office of Commissioner of the said City of Bayonne, comes into the Supreme Court of the State of New Jersey, and as relator files this, his information against Pierre P. Garvin, of the said City of Bayonne, thereby alleging that the said Pierre P. Garven usurps, intrudes into, and unlawfully holds and executes the said office as a Commissioner of the said City of Bayonne.

And the said relator, by Elmer W. Demarest, his attorney, hereby gives the said Court to be informed and understand that under and by virtue of an act of the Legislature of the State of New Jersey, entitled "An Act relating to, regulating, and providing for the government of cities, towns, boroughs, and other municipalities in this State," approved April 25, 1911, the provisions of said act were adopted by a majority vote of the voters voting at an election held on the ninth day of March, nineteen hundred and fifteen, in the said City of Bayonne; that thereafter the Clerk of the City of Bayonne, by virtue of the provisions of an act entitled "A supplement to an act entitled, 'An Act relating to, regulating and providing for the government

of cities, towns, boroughs, and other municipalities in this State,' approved April tweny-fifth, nineteen hundred and eleven," which supplement was approved April seventh, nineteen hundred and fourteen, gave notice of an election for five (5) Commissioners under said mentioned act and said supplement, to be held on the thirteenth day of April, nineteen hundred and fifteen; that within the time provided by said act of nineteen hundred and eleven, the following persons filed with the Clerk of the City of Bayonne nominations as candidates for Commissioners to be voted for at said election: John J. Cain, Matthew T. Cronin, Bert Daly, John O. Devlin, Pierre P. Garven, Henry Hinse, Hugh H. Mara, James H. Murphy, Horace Roberson, John P. Smith, Robert J. Talbot, Charles von Wallmenich, and Henry Wilson, and that the relator, Bert Daly, was one of the candidates for the election as a Commissioner; that said election was held in the said City of Bayonne on the said thirteenth day of April, nineteen hundred and fifteen, and five (5) Commissioners of the said City of Bayonne were chosen by the electors of the said City of Bayonne; that the Clerk of the City of Bayonne, as provided in said act, duly canvassed the votes cast at said election and declared the result of such canvass to be that the total number of votes cast as canvassed by him was 9,016; that the number of ballots rejected were 333, making a total of 9,349 ballots cast at said election; that the following persons, candidates for commissioners received the number of votes following their respective names:

Name.	*Number of Votes.*
John J. Cain	3,961
Matthew T. Cronin	4,312

Name.	*Number of Votes.*
Bert Daly	4,293
John O. Devlin	4,065
Pierre P. Garven	4,309
Henry Hinse	919
Hugh H. Mara	4,337
James H. Murphy	3,700
Horace Roberson	4,486
John P. Smith	3,700
Robert J. Talbot	1,603
Charles von Wallmenich	933
Henry Wilson	4,521

That the said City Clerk issued certificates of election to Henry Wilson, Horace Roberson, Hugh H. Mara, Matthew T. Cronin and Pierre P. Garven, who upon receipt of said certificates were sworn into office and entered upon the duties of said office of commissioners, and have ever since continued to execute the rights, franchises and privileges of said office; that subsequent thereto a recount of the ballots cast at said election was ordered by Honorable Francis J. Swayze, one of the Justices of the Supreme Court, and said recount was conducted by the Hudson County Board of Elections who made return to the Court as follows:

The total number of ballots cast at said election was 9349, and the number of ballots rejected was 300. That of the ballots cast and accepted by said Hudson County Board of Elections the following candidates received the number of votes set opposite their respective names and in the respective columns, as here set forth:

Name.	*1st*	*2nd*	*3rd*	*4th*	*Total*
John J. Cain.	3,907	65	3	4	3,979
Matthew T. Cronin	4,296	32	2	2	4,332
Bert Daly	4,259	47	2	1	4,309

INFORMATION

Name.	*1st*	*2nd*	*3rd*	*4th*	*Total*
John O. Devlin	3,976	100	2	1	4,079
Pierre P. Garven	4,259	73	3	3	4,338
Henry Hinse	665	249	5	3	922
Hugh H. Mara	4,284	72	2	1	4,358
James H. Murphy	3,574	133	6	1	3,714
Horace Roberson	4,425	64	42	—	4,494
John P. Smith	3,587	121	2	1	3,711
Robert J. Talbot	1,153	459	5	12	1,629
Charles von Wallmenich	627	298	5	5	935
Henry Wilson	4,397	139	3	5	4,541

That among ballots rejected were 192 ballots which were rejected contrary to law; that the following persons received of 192 ballots the number of votes were registered in the first column:

John J. Cain, 70; Matthew T. Cronin, 80; Bert Daly, 107; John O. Devlin, 83; Pierre P. Garven, 56; Henry Hinse, 16; Hugh H. Mara, 67; James H. Murphy, 65; Horace Roberson, 88; John P. Smith, 73; Robert J. Talbot, 32; Charles von Wallmenich, 18; Henry Wilson, 70.

And the said relator further gives the said Court to be informed and understand that the said 107 votes so rejected by said Hudson County Board of Elections contrary to law should be added and credited in said canvass to the said relator, thereby entitling the said relator to receive a certificate in the place and stead of Pierre P. Garven, as one of the Commissioners of said City of Bayonne.

That the said relator, by virtue of said election, was lawfully and duly elected one of the Commissioners of said City of Bayonne, and that the said relator has ever since been, and still is lawfully entitled to hold, use and execute the said office of Commissioner, as aforesaid, in the said City of

Bayonne, as aforesaid, which said office the said Pierre P. Garven, during all the time since the issuing of said certificate by said City Clerk, at said City of Bayonne, hath usurped, intruded into, and lawfully held, used and executed, and yet doth usurp, intrude into, and unlawfully hold, use and execute, to the exclusion of the said Bert Daly, to wit, in the said City of Bayonne, in the said County of Hudson aforesaid.

Wherefor the said relator prays the advice of the Court here in the premises, and that the said Pierre P. Garven may be made to answer to the said State of New Jersey by what warrant he claims to hold, use, execute and enjoy the aforesaid office of Commissioner of the said City of Bayonne, in said County of Hudson, and the liberties, privileges, and franchises thereof, and that said subsequent proceedings may be had as the statute in such case made and provided may direct.

BERT DALY,

Relator.

ELMER W. DEMAREST,

Attorney of Relator.

PLEA

NEW JERSEY SUPREME COURT.

BERT DALY, *Relator*, *vs.* PIERRE P. GARVEN, *Defendant*.	*On Information in the Nature of Quo Warranto.*

PLEA.

And now as yet of the term of June, in the year 1915, comes the said Pierre P. Garven, defendant, by Collins and Corbin, his attorneys, and having heard the information read, he complains that under color of the premises in the said information contained, he is greatly vexed and disquieted, and that by no means justly because, protesting that the said information and the matters therein contained are by no means sufficient in the law and that he need not, nor is he subject by law to answer thereto; yet for plea thereto he says that he ought not to be impeached or impleaded by reason of the premises in the said information contained, because he says that since March 10, 1869, by public charter approved, that the day the City of Bayonne, in the County of Hudson, has been an incorporated city, under the name of The Mayor and Council of the City of Bayonne, and ever since the date last named, has been and still is a body politic and corporate under said charter and various revisions and amendments thereof and supplements thereto; that on March 9, 1915, the provisions of "An Act relating to, regulating and providing for the government of cities, towns, boroughs, and other municipalities within this State," being Chapter 221, of

the Laws of New Jersey, of the year 1911, as afterwards amended and supplemented, was duly assented to and adopted by a majority of the legal voters of said city, voting at an election held on that day for the adoption or rejection by said city of the provisions of said act upon the request or petition in writing of 20 per centum of the legal voters voting at the last general election theretofore held, which election of March 9, 1915, was duly called by the City Clerk, who gave public notice of the time and place of holding the same as required by law, and at said election the votes cast in favor of the adoption of said act were equal to at least 30 per centum of the votes cast for members of the general assembly at the last general election immediately preceding the submission of said act, and the result of said election was duly certified and the said act and its provisions became operative in said city; that on April 13, 1915, being the fifth Tuesday following the election at which the provisions of said act were adopted an election was held in said City for the electing of five commissioners under said act, the said City of Bayonne having upwards of 10,000 population, which election was duly called and advertised according to law; that within due season proper petitions for nomination as candidates for commissioners to be voted for in said city were duly filed whereby the following named persons were nominated as candidates for commissioners, namely: John J. Cain, Matthew T. Cronin, Bert Daly, John O. Devlin, Pierre P. Garven (this defendant), Henry Hinse, Hugh H. Mara, James H. Murphy, Horace Roberson, John P. Smith, Robert J. Talbot, Charles von Wallmenich and Henry Wilson, and the names of said persons were printed upon the official ballots furnished according to law; that on the day following said last named election the City

Clerk of the City of Bayonne did determine the successful candidates by a cauvass publicly made in the manner provided by Chapter 108 of the Laws of New Jersey of the year 1914, and did immediately make and file the result thereof in the office of said City Clerk; that the candidates so determined to be successful were the said Matthew T. Cronin, Pierre P. Garven (this defendant) Hugh H. Mara, Horace Roberson and Henry Wilson, who received certificates of election duly issued to them respectively by the said City Clerk and all of whom accepted the office of Commissioner as aforesaid and duly qualified according to law, and thereafter in due season organized as a Board of Commissioners under said act and have ever since been acting as such Board of Commissioners in full control of the government of the said City of Bayonne.

And this defendant further says that the total number of ballots cast at said last named election was 9,349, of which there were counted by the various election boards 9,016 and lawfully rejected 333; that the vote received by the respective candidates as declared by said City Clerk was as follows:

John J. Cain .....received 3,961 votes
Matthew T. Cronin .....received 4,312 votes
Bert Daly .....received 4,293 votes
John O. Devlin ..... received 4,065 votes
Pierre P. Garven. .....received 4,309 votes
Henry Hinse .....received 919 votes
Hugh H. Mara ..... received 4,337 votes
James H. Murphy.....received 3,700 votes
Horace Roberson.....received 4,486 votes
John P. Smith ..... received 3,700 votes
Robert J. Talbot .....received 1,603 votes
Charles von Wallmenich ... received 933 votes
Henry Wilson .....received 4,521 votes

PLEA

That in a recount referred to in said information 33 of the ballots rejected by the election boards were counted, with the result which, if the same were lawfully counted, would change the number of votes cast for the different candidates from that certified by the City Clerk so that the same would be as follows:

John J. Cain	3,979 votes
Matthew T. Cronin	4,332 votes
Bert Daly	4,309 votes
John O. Devlin	4,079 votes
Pierre P. Garven	4,338 votes
Henry Hinse	922 votes
Hugh H. Mara	4,358 votes
James H. Murphy	3,714 votes
Horace Roberson	4,494 votes
John P. Smith	3,711 votes
Robert J. Talbot	1,629 votes
Charles von Wallmenich	935 votes
Henry Wilson	4,541 votes

And this defendant further says that all the ballots rejected by the election boards and not counted on said recount were properly and lawfully rejected; that no ballots were rejected contrary to law as in said information is alleged; and that on the valid ballots cast at said election this defendant received at least 4,338 votes and the said relator received not more than 4,309 votes.

Wherefore, this defendant says that since the organization of said Board of Commissioners of the said City of Bayonne he has lawfully held, used and executed and does now lawfully hold, use and execute the office of Commissioner of said City of Bayonne to the exclusion of said relator, without this, that the said defendant the said office, its liberties,

privileges and franchises in the said information mentioned or any of them has usurped or did usurp in manner and form as by the said information is alleged against him.

All and singular which matters and things this defendant is ready to verify and prove as the Court shall award, and prays judgment that the said office of Commissioner of the City of Bayonne, its liberties, privileges and franchises, by him claimed in manner aforesaid, may be allowed and adjudged to him, and that he may be discharged by the Court hereof and from the premises above charged against him.

COLLINS & CORBIN,
Attorneys for Defendant.

STATE OF NEW JERSEY,
COUNTY OF HUDSON, } ss.

PIERRE P. GARVEN, the above named defendant, of full age, being duly sworn according to law, on his oath says that the facts, matters and things set forth in the foregoing plea, so far as they relate to his own acts, are true and so far as they relate to the acts of others he believes them to be true; that said plea is not filed for the purpose of delay, and that he believes he has a legal defence to said action on the merits of the case.

PIERRE P. GARVEN.

Subscribed and sworn to at Jersey City, N. J., this June 4, A.D. 1915, before me.

DAVID A. NEWTON,
Attorney at Law of New Jersey.

ORDER AMENDING INFORMATION

NEW JERSEY SUPREME COURT.

BERT DALY, *Relator,* *vs.* PIERRE P. GARVEN, *Defendant.*	*On Information in Quo Warranto.*

ORDER.

Application being made to amend the information in this case and it appearing that notice thereof has been given and that no objection is made thereto by the defendant,

It is, on this fifteenth day of June, 1915, ordered, that the relator have leave to amend and that said information is hereby amended by inserting at the end of the paragraph containing the result of the canvass of the vote made by the Hudson County Board of Elections, the following:

"And the relation further given the Court to un-
"derstand and charges that Chapter 108 of the Laws
"of 1914, the statute under which said election was
"pretended to be held, it is void and opposed to the
"provisions of Section 1, Article II., of the Consti-
"tution of this State, wherein said statute provides
" that the ballot shall be void unless there shall be
"voted upon it as many first choices as there are
"offices to be filled because it abridges the choice
"of the voter."

And it is further ordered that the defendant have the same time to plead or demur thereto as he is allowed by law to file his pleadings.

Dated June 15, 1915.

F. J. SWAYZE, J. S. C.

NEW JERSEY SUPREME COURT.

BERT DALY, *Relator*, vs. PIERRE P. GARVEN, *Defendant.*	*On Information in the Nature of Quo Warranto.*

PLEA TO AMEND INFORMATION.

And now as yet of the term of June, in the year 1915, comes the said Pierre P. Garven, defendant, by Collins & Corbin, his attorneys, and having heard the amended information read he complains that under color of the premises in the said amended information contained he is greatly vexed and disquieted and that by no means justly, because, protesting that the said amended information and the matters therein contained are by no means sufficient in the law and that he need not nor is he subject by law to answer thereto; yet for plea thereto he says that he ought not to be impeached or impleaded by reason of the premises in the said amended information contained because he says that since March 10, 1869, by public charter approved that day the City of Bayonne, in the County of Hudson, has been an incorporated city under the name of the Mayor and Council of the City of Bayonne, and ever since the date last named has been and still is a body politic and corporate under said charter and various revisions and amendments thereof and supplements thereto; that on March 9, 1915, the provisions of "An Act relating to, regulating and pro-

viding for the government of cities, towns, boroughs and other municipalities within this State," being Chapter 221 of the Laws of New Jersey of the year 1911, as afterwards amended and supplemented, was duly assented to and adopted by a majority of the legal voters of said city voting at an election held on that day for the adoption or rejection by said city of the provisions of said act upon the request or petition in writing of 20 per centum of the legal voters voting at the last general election theretofore held, which election of March 9, 1915, was duly called by the City Clerk, who gave public notice of the time and place of holding the same as required by law, and at said election the votes cast in favor of the adoption of said act were equal to at least 30 per centum of the votes cast for members of the General Assembly at the last general election immediately preceding the submission of said act, and the result of said election was duly certified and the said act and its provisions became operative in said city; that on April 13, 1915, being the fifth Tuesday following the election at which the provisions of said act were adopted, an election was held in said city for the electing of five commissioners under said act, the said City of Bayonne having upwards of 10,000 population, which election was duly called and advertised according to law; that within due season proper petition for nomination as candidates for commissioners to be voted for in said city were duly filed whereby the following named persons were nominated as candidates for commissioners, namely: John J. Cain, Matthew T. Cronin, Bert Daly, John O. Devlin, Pierre P. Garven, (this defendant), Henry Hinse, Hugh H. Mara, James H. Murphy, Horace Roberson, John P. Smith, Robert J. Talbot, Charles von Wallmenich and Henry Wilson, and the names of said persons were printed

upon the official ballots furnished according to law; that on the day following said last named election the City Clerk of the City of Bayonne did determine the successful candidates by a canvass publicly made in the manner provided by Chapter 108 of the Laws of New Jersey of the year 1914, and did immediately make and file the result thereof in the office of said City Clerk; that the candidates so determined to be successful were the said Matthew T. Cronin, Pierre P. Garven, (this defendant), Hugh H. Mara, Horace Roberson and Henry Wilson, who received certificates of election duly issued to them respectively by the said City Clerk and all of whom accepted the office of commissioner as aforesaid and duly qualified according to law, and thereafter in due season organized as a Board of Commissioners under said act and have ever since been acting as such Board of Commissioners in full control of the government of the said City of Bayonne.

And this defendant further says that the total number of ballots cast at said last named election was 9,349, of which there were counted, by the various election boards, 9,016, and lawfully rejected, 333; that the vote received by the respective candidates, as declared by said City Clerk, was as follows:

John Cain.	received 3,961 votes
Matthew T. Cronin.	received 4,312 votes
Bert Daly.	received 4,293 votes
John O. Devlin.	received 4,065 votes
Pierre P. Garven.	received 4,309 votes
Henry Hinse.	received 919 votes
Hugh H. Mara.	received 4,337 votes
James H. Murphy.	received 3,700 votes
Horace Roberson.	received 4,486 votes
John P. Smith.	received 3,700 votes

Robert J. Talbot.. .....received 1,603 votes
Charles von Wallmenich.....received 933 votes
Henry Wilson.. .....received 4,521 votes

That in a recount referred to in said amended information thirty-three of the ballots rejected by the Election Boards were counted, with the result which, if the same were lawfully counted, would change the number of votes cast for the different candidates from that certified by the City Clerk, so that the same would be as follows:

John J. Cain..... .....3,979 votes
Matthew T. Cronin. .....4,332 votes
Bert Daly.....4,309 votes
John O. Devlin .....4,079 votes
Pierre P. Garven..... .....4,338 votes
Henry Hinse..... ..... 922 votes
Hugh H. Mara .....4,358 votes
James H. Murphy .....3,714 votes
Horace Roberson..... 4,494 votes
John P. Smith..... ....3,711 votes
Robert J. Talbot.....1,629 votes
Charles von Wallmenich..... 935 votes
Henry Wilson.....4,541 votes

And this defendant further says that all the ballots rejected by the Election Boards, and not counted on said recount, were properly and lawfully rejected; that no ballots were rejected contrary to law, as in said amended information is alleged, and that on the valid ballots cast at said election, this defendant received at least 4,338 votes, and the said relator received not more than 4,309 votes, and that Chapter 108, of the Laws of 1914, is not void or opposed to the provisions of Section 1, Ar-

ticle II., of the Constitution of the State, as in said amended information is alleged.

Wherefore, this defendant says that since the organization of said Board of Commissioners of the said City of Bayonne, he has lawfully held, used and executed, and does now lawfully hold, use and execute the office of Commissioner of said City of Bayonne, to the exclusion of said relator, without this, that the said defendant the said office, its liberties, privileges and franchises in the said amended information mentioned, or any of them, has usurped or did usurp in manner and form as by the said amended information is above alleged against him.

All and singular, which matters and things this defendant is ready to verify and prove as the Court shall award, and prays judgment that the said office of Commissioner of the City of Bayonne, its liberties, privileges and franchises by him claimed in manner aforesaid, may be allowed and adjudged to him, and that he may be discharged by the Court hereof, and from the premises above charged against him.

COLLINS & CORBIN,
Attorneys for Defendant.

STATE OF NEW JERSEY, }
COUNTY OF HUDSON, } ss.

PIERRE P. GARVEN, the above named defendant, of full age, being duly sworn according to law, on his oath says that the facts, matters and things set forth in the foregoing plea to the amended information, so far as they relate to his own acts, are true, and so far as they relate to the acts of others he believes them to be true; that said plea is not filed for the purpose of delay, and that he believes

he has a legal defence to said action on the merits of the case.

PIERRE P. GARVEN.

Subscribed and sworn to at Jersey City, N. J., this June 25, A. D. 1915, before me.

GEORGE W. C. SCHMIDT,
Commissioner of Deeds of N. J.

NEW JERSEY SUPREME COURT.

BERT DALY,
Relator,

vs.

PIERRE P. GARVEN,
Defendant.

On Information in the Nature of Quo Warranto.

REPLICATION.

And as to the said plea of the defendant by him above pleaded wherein he says:

1. Three hundred and thirty-three ballots were lawfully rejected by the Clerk of the City of Bayonne.

2. That all the ballots rejected by the election boards and not counted in said recount were properly and lawfully rejected.

3. That no ballots were rejected contrary to law.

4. That on the valid ballots cast at said election

the defendant received at least 4,338 votes and the relator not more than 4,309 votes.

5. That Chapter 108 of the Laws of 1914, is not void or opposed to the provisions of Section 1, Article II., of the Constitution of this State.

6. That the defendant lawfully holds, uses and executes the office of the Commissioner of the City of Bayonne to the exclusion of the relator.

The relator says that he, by reason of anything in that plea alleged, ought not to be barred from having or maintaining his aforesaid action against him to recover the said office and this he, the relator, prays may be inquired of by the country.

ELMER W. DEMAREST,
Attorney for Relator.

NEW JERSEY SUPREME COURT.

BERT DALY,

vs.

PIERRE P. GARVEN,

Tried January 2, 1917, before Speer, J., without a jury.

JOHN MILTON for the relator.

COLLINS & CORBIN for the defendant.

Mr. MILTON—A short explanation of the issues involved:

The Commission Government Act, as your

Honor knows, is Chapter 221 of the Laws of 1911. It provides for a referendum—acceptance or adoption by the people of the municipality, and that was adopted in the City of Bayonne. In municipalities having a population of more than ten thousand a Board of Commissioners, five in number, is to be chosen, and at the time of the adoption of the act by the City of Bayonne there was a primary at which everybody who got the requisite number of signatures could run—a sort of elimination contest—and about ten times five were chosen. (Mr. Rugge advises me there was no primary in Bayonne. The law was changed before that election). Now, the following persons filed with the City Clerk of Bayonne their nominating petitions: John J. Cain, Matthew T. Cronin, Bert Daly, John O. Devlin, Pierre P. Garven, Henry Hinse, Hugh H. Mara, James H. Murphy, Horace Roberson, John P. Smith, Robert J. Talbot, Charles von Wallmenich and Henry Wilson. The election was held under the provisions of the so-called Hennessy Preferential Act, being Chapter 108 of the Laws of 1914, which requires a form of ballot containing four columns opposite the names of the candidates, entitled "First Choice; Second Choice; Third Choice; Other Choice." The voter is required, under this act, or was at the time of this election, although the law has been changed since the election, to vote in the first choice column for as many candidates as there were offices to be filled. In Bayonne he had to vote for five first choices. He could vote for as many second, third and other choices as he chose. I say that has been changed since 1914 so as to leave it optional with the voter whether

or not he shall vote for five first choices. Now, what happened is this: A number of ballots were cast at the election in the City of Bayonne which did not contain any indication or preference in the first choice column. Those ballots were rejected by the district boards. There was a recount of the vote before the County Board of Election and the ballots likewise rejected by the County Board. Doctor Daly says that the section of the act which requires that the first choice column be marked for as many candidates as there are offices to be filled is unconstitutional and that the ballots which have preferences or marks in the first choice column, whether there be five or not, should be counted and that the rejection of those ballots by the district boards and by the County Board was illegal and unlawful; that the ballots should be counted, and if counted will result in his being elected over Mr. Garven, the defendant to this information. The number of votes which Dr. Daly says he would receive if those rejected ballots were counted is 107; Mr. Garven would receive 56. The vote as it stands without the rejected ballots being counted is: Garven, 4,338; Daly, 4,309; so that you see if you add the 107 to Daly and 56 to Garven, as the count stands, it will result in Daly being elected over Garven.

THE COURT—The point for my decision is as to whether or not this act is unconstitutional?

Mr. MILTON—Yes.

Mr. COLLINS—And the Supreme Court has decided that it is constitutional. I think it is only a step to take that to the Court of Errors. I suggested last summer that the pleadings be

amended to bring the question squarely up and have a demurrer and then go to the Court of Errors. Mr. Milton thought it could be done on the present pleadings.

THE COURT—Is it admitted that the Supreme Court has determined that it is constitutional?

Mr. MILTON—What happened is this: At about the same time that the act was accepted in Bayonne it was likewise accepted in the City New Brunswick and Commissioners were elected in that city, and there was a sort of a joint contest between the Commissioners in Bayonne and the Commissioners in New Brunswick. The New Brunswick contest and Devlin vs. Wilson, the Bayonne contest, went to the Supreme Court on certiorari. The Watson case, reported in 87 N. J. L., was decided by Mr. Justice Bergen. There was a writ of certiorari taken out and he went into the merits of the controversy and held the act constitutional. That case went on its way to the Court of Errors.

Mr. COLLINS—On this very point.

Mr. MILTON—That case went to the Court of Errors; I think Mr. Justice Gummere writing the opinion—at least he wrote the opinion in Devlin vs. Wilson, holding that certiorari was not the remedy; that the effect of the application was to oust the entire city government of Bayonne as it was then constituted—or New Brunswick—and that could only be done by the Attorney General acting on behalf of the State. Mr. Justice Bergen dismissed the writ in the Supreme Court on the ground the act was constitutional. The Court of Errors

says that question as to the merits of the controversy was not before the Court and consequently the Supreme Court's action in dismissing the writ must of necessity be affirmed. Now, my notion is that the effect of the Court of Errors' decision is that the merits of that controversy were never before the Supreme Court, so that Mr. Justice Bergen's opinion is not controlling upon your Honor.

THE COURT—What he practically decided was that it was not properly before the Court.

Mr. MILTON—Not properly before the Court.

THE COURT—But it was before the Court when it decided it.

Mr. MILTON—There is no question about that.

Mr. COLLINS—It was before the Court and it was decided. That is all there is to it.

THE COURT—I do not see, Mr. Milton, under the circumstances, what I have to do, except to treat this act in the usual method of treatment, as being constitutional. Not only have I the general consensus of the opinion of the Judges who deal with matters of this kind, aside from my adjudication on the subject that it is rather unseemly for a Judge sitting merely at the Circuit to hold an act unconstitutional, unless it is so flatly, and obviously, and plainly unconstitutional, as that he who runs might say that it was; but I have the decision of the Supreme Court in a thing properly or improperly before it, deciding that the act is constitutional. Now, it would be, it seems to me, a bit of presumption on my part, to rise up and smite the decision of the Supreme Court and say:

"Well, because this was not properly before you, I do not think, therefore, that I am to pay that respect to your opinion which the general trend of judicial authority seems to indicate ought to be paid even to an obiter dictum." That is the way it appeals to me.

Mr. MILTON—That, I think, might be true, if your Honor were sitting in the trial of a case before a jury, where you had to make up a snap judgment as the basis of a charge to a jury, or in deciding upon a motion to non-suit, or a motion to direct a verdict. But here your Honor is sitting both as the Judge of the facts and of the law.

THE COURT—Well, the facts are without dispute, as I understand it.

Mr. MILTON—I think that is so.

THE COURT—And all that I am required to pass upon is whether an act, adopted with all solemnity by the Legislature of the State, is constitutional or unconstitutional and, aside from the general inclination which would naturally require a Judge sitting here to decide that it was constitutional, unless it was flatly unconstitutional, because that is the seemly way, at least, to dispose of it, I have the decision of the Supreme Court that it was constitutional. Now, the Court of Errors says that the question was not properly before it at the time but, evidently, it was actually, as a fact, before it, and they decided it, and I do not see why I should reverse that situation at this time.

Mr. MILTON—My notion of the effect of the Court of Errors decision is that it wipes the

slate clean, it is as though the Supreme Court had never decided that question.

THE COURT—I do not think so. If they had reversed the decision upon that point it would then have been equivalent to an adjudication on the part of the Court of Errors that the Supreme Court had mistaken the law.

Mr. COLLINS—They affirmed the judgment.

Mr. MILTON—They affirmed the judgment because there was nothing else to do. The Court of Errors says to the Supreme Court: "Certiorari is not the appropriate remedy. What you are attempting to do indirectly is to inquire into the legality of the form of government now existing in the City of Bayonne and the City of New Brunswick, and that you cannot do except by motion of the Attorney General as the representative of the State." Now, it seems to me at least that the effect of that is to say to the Supreme Court: "This case should never have been decided; the merits should never have been inquired into."

THE COURT—Precisely.

Mr. MILTON—"The writ should never have been allowed."

THE COURT—Precisely; but it is not to wipe out the fact of the decision. The fact remains so and I do not see why I should overturn that at this time. So I think that both on the ground that the seemliness of the situation requires me to decide the case favorably to the defendant, so also does the information of the judgment of the Supreme Court on that question require the same thing; so that is what I shall decide, and you may have, if it is neces-

sary, an objection in the nature of an exception to my ruling on that subject, so that you can review it.

Mr. MILTON—We want to go to the Court of Errors, of course.

THE COURT—Exactly. I expected that.

Mr. COLLINS—We have been looking at the recent statute that removes some of the technical features that used to apply to a case tried by a Judge without a jury. He had to have special findings. We are a little uncertain what it means. But I want to get this record right. He has stated that there is no dispute about the facts. That is true, to the extent that the return of the local board is so and so, and the recount is so and so, and there are so many ballots rejected, and they are of such and such a character. Now, here is the trouble: Mr. Daly says that he had more votes than Mr. Garven. That is also true. But Mr. Garven had more than Mr. Cronin, who has been declared elected, and it does not follow that Mr. Garven is the one that usurps Mr. Daly's office. Indeed, so troubled were they about that that Mr. Demarest, who then represented Doctor Daly, when he applied to the Attorney General to file a quo warranto of his own motion, and the Attorney General would not do it—he said he would not interfere with it—Mr. Demarest went to Justice Swayze to get leave to file a quo warranto in the name of the Attorney General, having an idea that as the Attorney General would not act, a relator could file an information in the name of the Attorney General, and he wanted it against Cronin and Garven because he said he could not tell which

was the one. I recall it very distinctly. And Justice Swayze would not let him file one because, he said, "This is not the Attorney General doing this; you are simply using his name;" and he would not do it. But it remained just the same that my friend's colleague thought that it was uncertain who was the one that would have to be ousted. Now, how can you oust Mr. Garven when he has more votes than Mr. Cronin? I think he ought to get his record straight. I only speak of this out of kindness to him. I would not want you to assume that there is no dispute about the fact. There is no dispute, but the facts ought to all be stated.

Mr. MILTON—I made the suggestion to Judge Collins this morning that we probably ought to file with you requests to find under the old statute, but Judge Collins says there is a new statute.

Mr. COLLINS—I take it, under this new statute, that we do not have to any more formulate requests to find, but what it does mean I am not quite certain.

THE COURT—I think it is sufficient for me, on this hearing to decide, as a matter of law, that that act is constitutional, and that therefore there is not anything for me to decide with respect to the matter of whether or not, if it be true that Dr. Daly had more votes than Mr. Garven that therefore Mr. Garven was elected or was not elected, because that is a matter of indifference now.

Mr. MILTON—If the act is good.

THE COURT—Yes; if the act is good it does

not make any difference who has more votes than anybody else, except the fact that the act being constitutional it appears, as a matter of fact, that Mr. Garven does have more votes.

Mr. COLLINS—But suppose, of course, they can review; that is the purpose of it; you follow the Supreme Court, but they have an open door left; suppose the Court of Errors should hold that that section of the act is unconstitutional—they have held that the act as a whole is constitutional—but suppose they should hold that that section was unconstitutional, then they would have to find what judgment should be given, so we should have to come back here to be re-heard.

THE COURT—Come back here to be re-heard?

Mr. COLLINS—They say "changed, reversed or modified." I was wondering whether it would not be necessary to have the record show what those rejected ballots were.

Mr. MILTON—Let's put them in.

Mr. COLLINS—I should think, under these pleadings, there would have to be some evidence put in of the original count and the recount, and these rejected ballots.

THE COURT—Yes; unless it is stipulated what the facts are with respect to them.

Mr. COLLINS—I do not know, but we can stipulate. Do you agree to stipulate? I guess we can stipulate. Then we do not need to keep you. We understand what your Honor's decision will be, and we can stipulate. There is no need to call witnesses.

Mr. MILTON—You think we do not need to

file requests to find? I do not know what the act means.

THE COURT—I think the very object of that statute was to do away with requests to find?

Mr. COLLINS—That is my opinion. I think we can stipulate what the facts are. I do not mean right here in Court.

Mr. MILTON—Let us put these ballots in.

THE COURT—Let them be marked as a batch. What do you want to do about the custody of the ballots? These ballots have been in Mr. Bowly's custody right along for several weeks. What do you want to do about them, once they are admitted?

Mr. MILTON—I think they were put in his custody by Judge Swayze. I think he ought to take them back.

Mr. COLLINS—I think we ought to have copies of them to put in this record. They have never been opened. Perhaps they ought to be opened here and copies made of them and Mr. Bowly seal them up.

Mr. MILTON—Let Mr. Bowly be sworn.

GEORGE BOWLY, sworn.

Mr. COLLINS—I suppose you want first to put on the record that it is stipulated that on March 9, 1915, in the City of Bayonne, a municipal corporation chartered on March 10, 1869, under the name of the Mayor and Council of the City of Bayonne, the provisions of an act relating to, regulating and providing for the government of cities, towns, boroughs and other municipalities within this State, being Chapter 221 of the Laws of New Jersey of the

year 1911, as afterward amended and supplemented, was duly assented to and adopted by a majority of the legal voters of said city who voted at an election held on that day for the adoption or rejection by said city of the provisions of said act upon the request or petition in writing of twenty per centum of the legal voters voting at the last general election theretofore held, which election of March 9, 1915, was duly called by the city clerk, who gave public notice of the time and place of holding the same as required by law, and at said election the votes cast in favor of the adoption of said act were equal to at least thirty per centum of the votes cast for members of the general assembly at the last general election immediately preceding the submission of said act, and the result of said election was duly certified and the said act and its provisions became operative in said city; that on April 13, 1915, being the fifth Tuesday following the election at which the provisions of said act were adopted an election was held in said city for the electing of five commissioners under said act, the said City of Bayonne having upwards of 10,000 population, which election was duly called and advertised according to law; that within due season proper petitions for nomination as candidates for Commissioners to be voted for in said city were duly filed, whereby the following named persons were nominated as candidates for Commissioners, namely, John J. Cain, Matthew T. Cronin, Bert Daly, John O. Devlin, Pierre P. Garven, Henry Hinse, Hugh H. Mara, James H. Murphy, Horace Roberson, John P. Smith, Robert J. Talbot, Charles von Wallmenich and Henry Wilson, and the names

of said persons were printed upon the official ballots furnished according to law; that on the day following said last named election the City Clerk of the City of Bayonne did determine the successful candidates by a canvass publicly made in the manner provided by Chapter 108 of the Laws of New Jersey, of the year 1914, and did immediately make and file the result thereof in the office of said City Clerk; that the candidates so determined to be successful were the said Matthew T. Cronin, Pierre P. Garven, Hugh H. Mara, Horace Roberson and Henry Wilson, who received certificates of election duly issued to them respectively by the said City Clerk, and all of whom accepted the office of Commissioner, as aforesaid, and duly qualified according to law, and thereafter, in due season organized as a Board of Commissioners under said act, and have ever since been acting as such Board of Commissioners, in full control of the government of the said City of Bayonne.

Now, that is fundamental. We all admit that. Now, what more do you want? I leave it to you.

Mr. MILTON—It is further stipulated that subsequent thereto a recount of the ballots cast at said election was ordered by the Honorable Francis J. Swayze, one of the Justices of the Supreme Court, and said recount was conducted by the Hudson County Board of Elections, who made a return to the Court as follows:

The total number of ballots cast at said election was 9,349, and the total number of ballots rejected was 300; that of the ballots cast and accepted by said Hudson County Board of Elec-

tions the following candidates received the number of votes set opposite their respective names in the respective columns as here set forth:

Name	1st	2nd	3rd	4th	Total
John J. Cain	3907	65	3	4	3979
Matthew T. Cronin.	4296	32	2	2	4332
Bert Daly	4259	47	2	1	4309
John O. Devlin	3976	100	2	1	4079
Pierre P. Garven	4259	73	3	3	4338
Henry Hinse	665	249	5	3	922
Hugh H. Mara	4284	72	2	1	4358
James H. Murphy	3574	133	6	1	3714
Horace Roberson	4425	64	42		4494
John P. Smith.	3587	121	2	1	3711
Robert J. Talbot	1153	459	5	12	1629
Charles von Wallmenich	627	298	5	5	935
Henry Wilson	4397	136	3	5	4551

Mr. COLLINS—That is right. We agree on that. Now you see that Garven had more than Cronin.

Mr. MILTON—He had six more. That among the ballots rejected were 192 ballots—

Mr. COLLINS—No; the ballots were 192 which were rejected. By the way, there were a good many more rejected, and some of them were properly rejected. That nobody objects to. It is only those that were rejected, because they did not have five names in the first column.

THE COURT—Why don't you say: "Among the rejected ballots were 192 which are claimed to have been rejected illegally by the relator?"

Mr. COLLINS—Claimed by the relator that they should not have been rejected?

THE COURT—Illegally rejected.

Mr. COLLINS—But I think it ought to be stated what the fact was about them, that they were rejected because they did not have five names in the first choice.

THE COURT—Well, put that down; that fixes it; claimed to have been illegally rejected because they did not have five names in the column for first choice.

Mr. MILTON—That is right.

Mr. COLLINS—That is right.

Mr. MILTON—That of said 192 ballots the following persons received the number of votes set opposite their respective names—

Mr. COLLINS—I would not admit that—that they did receive them.

Mr. MILTON—Strike that out. That upon the 192 ballots so rejected there were choices—

Mr. COLLINS—Why not put them in?

THE COURT—"The names of the following persons appeared in the first column the number of times set opposite thereto."

Mr. COLLINS—You see, there is another element that might come there; I should think it would be wiser for all concerned that those 192 ballots be offered in evidence and printed on their case for this reason: Suppose they were improperly rejected and you count them; it might be that the third, or fourth, or fifth, choice added together might bring the thing out differently. If we just limit ourselves to what the first column shows, the Court does not have all the elements.

THE COURT—Then why don't you say: "which 192 ballots are offered in evidence and marked?"

Mr. MILTON—All right.

Mr. COLLINS—I object to them as irrelevant.

THE COURT—All right; and I suppose the thing for me to do is to sustain the objection, because the ballots are not in conformity to the act, and then you enter on the record your objection to that ruling.

MR. MILTON—How do I get those ballots before the Court?

THE COURT—How do you get a contract before the Court when the Court overrules it?

MR. MILTON—Then I object, or except, to your Honor's ruling.

THE COURT—All right; and I grant an objection in the nature of an exception; and of course I rule that upon the ground that I consider the act constitutional, and find in favor of the defendant.

MR. MILTON—I think I ought to ask your Honor to find. I am a little afraid of that statute.

THE COURT—All right; go ahead.

MR. MILTON—I ask your Honor to find that the act is unconstitutional—not the act; that section of the act which requires the voter to mark in the first choice column as many candidates as there are offices to be filled, is unconstitutional.

MR. COLLINS—"That requires the rejection of ballots that are not so marked."

Mr. MILTON—Yes, that requires the rejection of ballots that are not so marked, is unconstitutional, and that the 192 ballots so rejected which appear to have been voted for Bert Daly should be counted.

THE COURT—And I refuse so to find, and give you an exception to that ruling.

Mr. COLLINS—I suggest, if your Honor is willing and counsel is willing, that Mr. Bowly retain those rejected ballots, and when they are ready to print, Mr. Garven and Mr. Milton, and of course Doctor Daly, get together and make up—

Mr. MILTON—That is all right; we can make fac-simile copies of them.

FINDINGS AND POSTEA

NEW JERSEY SUPREME COURT.

HUDSON COUNTY.

BERT DALY,
Relator,

v.

PIERRE P. GARVEN,
Defendant.

On Quo Warranto.

FINDINGS AND POSTEA.

This cause was tried without a jury at the December term of the Circuit Court of Hudson County, by the Honorable William H. Speer, Judge of said Circuit Court, to whom the same was referred for trial by Honorable Francis J. Swayze, Associate Justice of the Supreme Court, holding said Circuit.

After hearing the evidence and counsel for the parties, the Judge found:

1. That Chapter 108 of the Laws of 1914 is not void or opposed to the provisions of Section I., Article II., of the Constitution of this State as in the amended information alleged; and

2. That the defendant has not usurped and does not usurp the office of Commissioner of the City of Bayonne, its liberties, privileges and franchises, in the said amended information mentioned, or any or either of them, in manner and form as by the said amended information is alleged against him.

WM. H. SPEER,
J.

JUDGMENT

NEW JERSEY SUPREME COURT.

BERT DALY, *Relator*, v. PIERRE P. GARVEN, *Defendant*.	*On Quo Warranto. On Postea. Collins & Corbin, Attorneys.*

Costs, $39.10.

Judgment entered this fourth day of January, A. D. nineteen and seventeen, for the sum of thirty-nine dollars and ten cents, costs in favor of the defendant and against the relator.

WM. S. GUMMERE,
C. J.

I, William C. Gebbardt, Clerk of the Supreme Court of the State of New Jersey, do certify that the foregoing is a true copy of the judgment entered in above stated cause which said judgment is recorded in this office in Vol. 10 of Judgments, page 4.

In testimony whereof I have hereunto set my hand and seal of said Court at Trenton, this twentieth day of January, A. D. nineteen hundred and seventeen.

[SEAL.]

WM. C. GEBHARDT,
Clerk.

BALLOT No. 1 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

	FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
X	JOHN J. CAIN				
X	MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
	BERT DALY				
	JOHN O. DEVLIN				
X	PIERRE P. GARVEN				
	HENRY HINSE				
X	HUGH H. MARA				
	JAMES H. MURPHY				
	HORACE ROBERSON				
	JOHN P. SMITH				
	ROBERT J. TALBOT				
	CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
X	HENRY WILSON				

Ballot No. 153 Rejected by the order of the Court

BALLOT No. 2 SECOND WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE	X			
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

Ballot No. 8 Rejected by order of Court

BALLOT No. 3 SECOND WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH	X			
HENRY WILSON				
	X			

BALLOT No. 4 THIRD WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	/			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	/			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE	/			
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	/			
HORACE ROBERSON	/			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 5 THIRD WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	/			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	/			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	/			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	/			
JAMES H. MURPHY	/			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

Ballot No. 5 — Printed by order of the Court

BALLOT No. 6 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	V			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	V			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	V			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	V			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	V			

BALLOT No. 7 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	/			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	/			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	/			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH	/			
HENRY WILSON	/			

Ballot No. 356 — Rejected by order of the Court

BALLOT No. 8 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X	X	X	X
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X	X	X	X
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE	X	X	X	X
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X	X	X	X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X	X	X	X
	/			

BALLOT No. 9 FIFTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X	X	X	X
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X	X	X	X
JOHN P. SMITH	X	X	X	X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH	X	X	X	X
HENRY WILSON	X	X	X	X

Ballot No. 11 Counted for [illegible]

BALLOT No. 10 FIRST WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 11 FIRST WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

Ballot No. for Ordinance entitled "An

BALLOT No. 12 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X	X	X	X
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X	X	X	X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X	X	X	X
JOHN P. SMITH	X	X	X	X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X	X	X	X

BALLOT No. 13 SECOND WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				X
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

Ballot No. 210 Counted by order of the Court

BALLOT No. 14 THIRD WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
~~BERT DALY~~				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
~~PIERRE P. GARVEN~~				
HENRY HINSE	X			
~~HUGH H. MARA~~				
~~JAMES H. MURPHY~~				
~~HORACE ROBERSON~~				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
~~CHARLES VON WALLMENICH~~				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 15 SECOND WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	4			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	4			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	4			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	4			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT		4		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	4			

Ballot No. 3 Ordered printed by the Court

BALLOT No. 16 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

	FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
	JOHN J. CAIN				
	MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
V	BERT DALY	X			
	JOHN O. DEVLIN				
	PIERRE P. GARVEN				
	HENRY HINSE				
	HUGH H. MARA				
	JAMES H. MURPHY				
V	HORACE ROBERSON	X			
V	JOHN P. SMITH	X			
	ROBERT J. TALBOT				
V	CHARLES VON WALLMENICH	X			
V	HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 17 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN V	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN V	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN V	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON V	X			

BALLOT No. 18 FIRST WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE	X			
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	erasure	X		
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	erasure	X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT	erasure	X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH	erasure	X		
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 19 FIRST WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 20 FIRST WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 21 FIRST WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	~~X~~	X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 22 FIRST WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				X
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 23 FIRST WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 24 FIRST WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 25 FIRST WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN			X	
PIERRE P. GARVEN				X
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 26 FIRST WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 27 FIRST WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 28 FIRST WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY			X	
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE		X		
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 29 FIRST WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 30 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT		X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH		X		
HENRY WILSON		X		

BALLOT No. 31 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 32 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				X
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 33 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	erasure	X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	erasure		X	
HORACE ROBERSON	erasure			X
JOHN P. SMITH	erasure			X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 34 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 35 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 86 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 37 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN			X	
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 38 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				X
JOHN O. DEVLIN				X
PIERRE P. GARVEN				X
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 40 FIRST WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 41 FIRST WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN			X	
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X		X	
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT			X	
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 42 FIRST WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 43 FIRST WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 44 FIRST WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN		X		
BERT DALY				X
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				X
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 45 FIRST WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN			X	
MATTHEW T. CRONIN			X	
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN			X	
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON			X	

BALLOT No. 46 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 47 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 48 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 49 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 50 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 51 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 52 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 53 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 54 FIRST WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				X
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				X
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 55 FIRST WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN		X		
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON		X		

BALLOT No. 56 FIRST WARD, SEVENT DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 57 FIRST WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 58 FIRST WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X	X		
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				X
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 59 FIRST WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 60 SECOND WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 61 SECOND WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN			X	
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY		X		
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 62 SECOND WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 63 SECOND WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 64 SECOND WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY		X		
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 65 SECOND WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				X
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 66 SECOND WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 67 SECOND WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 68 SECOND WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 69 SECOND WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				X
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 70 SECOND WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 71 SECOND WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				X
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 72 SECOND WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY		X		
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				X
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 73 SECOND WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 74 SECOND WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 76 SECOND WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY		X		
JOHN O. DEVLIN			X	
PIERRE P. GARVEN		erasure	X	
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 77 SECOND WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 78 SECOND WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN		X		
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN		X		
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON		X		

BALLOT No. 79 SECOND WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN		X		
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH			X	
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 80 SECOND WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN		X		
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				X
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				X
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON			X	

BALLOT No. 81 SECOND WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				X
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON			X	

BALLOT No. 82 SECOND WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT		X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 84 SECOND WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE.				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 85 SECOND WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 86 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 87 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				X
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				X
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT		X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 88 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 89 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				X
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 90 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 91 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH	X			
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 92 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 93 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY		X		
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON			X	

BALLOT No. 94 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN			X	
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				X
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FORCO MMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				X
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON		X		

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON		X		

BALLOT No. 97 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN			X	
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				X
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 98 SECOND WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE			X	
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT			X	
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON			X	

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN			X	
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 100 SECOND WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH			X	
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 101 SECOND WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN			X	
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 102 SECOND WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT		X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 104 SECOND WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 105 SECOND WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 106 SECOND WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 107 SECOND WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FORCO MMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 108 THIRD WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 109 THIRD WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 110 THIRD WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				X
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 111 THIRD WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN			X	
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				X
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON		X		

BALLOT No. 112 THIRD WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				X
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON			X	

BALLOT No. 113 THIRD WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 114 THIRD WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE			X	
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 116 THIRD WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 117 THIRD WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 118 THIRD WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN			X	
BERT DALY		X		
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH			X	
HENRY WILSON				
				X

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 120 THIRD WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE			X	
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 121 THIRD WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 122 THIRD WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN			X	
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT		X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON				

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN			X	
HENRY HINSE				X
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 124 THIRD WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 125 THIRD WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 126 THIRD WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN		X		
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 127 THIRD WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 128 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 129 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	erasure	X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	erasure		X	
HORACE ROBERSON	erasure			X
JOHN P. SMITH	erasure	X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 130 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON				X

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT			X	
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON		X		

BALLOT No. 132 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY		X		
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT			X	
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 133 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				X
MATTHEW T. CRONIN			X	
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN		X		
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 134 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON				X

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 136 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT		X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH			X	
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 137 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 138 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				X
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT		X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH			X	
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 139 THIRD WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON		X		

BALLOT No. 140 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	erasure			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE	X			
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 142 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				X
MATTHEW T. CRONIN		X		
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 143 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				X
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT		X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 144 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 145 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN		X		
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN		erasure	X	
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 146 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	erasure		X	
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 147 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				X
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 148 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH			X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 149 THIRD WARD, SIXTH DISTRICT

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 150 THIRD WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 151 THIRD WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 152 THIRD WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 154 THIRD WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 155 THIRD WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN			X	
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 156 THIRD WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 157 THIRD WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN		X		
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN		X		
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 158 THIRD WARD, SEVENTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 159 FOURTH WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 160 FOURTH WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				X
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 161 FOURTH WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 162 FOURTH WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 163 FOURTH WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 164 FOURTH WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 166 FOURTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 167 FOURTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	/			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 168 FOURTH WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE		X		
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON		X		

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 170 FOURTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 171 FOURTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 172 FOURTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 174 FOURTH WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY		X		
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN			X	
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 175 FOURTH WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN			X	
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON		X		

BALLOT No. 176 FOURTH WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				X
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FORCOMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE	X			
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 178 FOURTH WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 179 FOURTH WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN			X	
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				X
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 180 FOURTH WARD, FIFTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 181 FIFTH WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY			X	
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 182 FIFTH WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 183 FIFTH WARD, FIRST DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 184 FIFTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT		X		
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				X
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 186 FIFTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 187 FIFTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 188 FIFTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 189 FIFTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH		erasure	X	
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 190 FIFTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN			X	
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN			X	
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA		X		
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 192 FIFTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 193 FIFTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 194 FIFTH WARD, SECOND DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 195 FIFTH WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY		X		
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH		X		
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 196 FIFTH WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY			X	
HORACE ROBERSON				X
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN		X		
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN			X	
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA			X	
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON			X	

BALLOT No. 198 FIFTH WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN	X			
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				
	X			

BALLOT No. 199 FIFTH WARD, THIRD DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 200 FIFTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY		X		
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE	X			
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON			X	
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN	X			
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT	X			
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 202 FIFTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE			X	
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		X		
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				X
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 203 FIFTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN		X		
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON		erasure	X	
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				X
HENRY WILSON				X

BALLOT No. 204 FIFTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				X
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT			X	
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN	X			
MATTHEW T. CRONIN	X			
BERT DALY				
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA	X			
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH				
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON	X			

BALLOT No. 206 FIFTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY			X	
JOHN O. DEVLIN		X		
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				X
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY				
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH				X
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 207 FIFTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN		X		
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON	X			
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

BALLOT No. 208 FIFTH WARD, FOURTH DISTRICT

FOR COMMISSIONERS	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
JOHN J. CAIN				
MATTHEW T. CRONIN				
BERT DALY	X			
JOHN O. DEVLIN				
PIERRE P. GARVEN				
HENRY HINSE				
HUGH H. MARA				
JAMES H. MURPHY	X			
HORACE ROBERSON				
JOHN P. SMITH	X			
ROBERT J. TALBOT				
CHARLES VON WALLMENICH				
HENRY WILSON				

NEW JERSEY

Court of Errors and Appeals.

BERT DALY, *Relator below—Appellant,* *vs.* PIERRE GARVEN, *Defendant below—Respondent.*	*On Appeal from Supreme Court.*

Memorandum for Appellant.

This is a quo warranto proceeding instituted by appellant, Daly against respondent Garven, to test the right of Garven to hold the office of Commssiioner in the City of Bayonne. The information is filed under the authority of the fourth Section of the Quo Warranto Act, Comp. St., V ol. III., page 4212.

Prior to April, 1915, the City of Bayonne was governed by a Mayor and Common Council. In March of that year the Commission Government Act, P. L. 1911, Chapter 221, was accepted or adopted by the voters. Thereafter at the times and in the manner fixed by the act and a certain supplement an election was held for Commissioners. This was on April 13, 1915.

The persons who filed nominating petitions were John J. Cain, Matthew T. Cronin, Bert Daly, John O. Devlin, Pierre P. Garven, Henry Hines, Hugh H. Mara, James H. Murphy, Horace Roberson, John P. Smith, Robert J. Talbot, Charles von Wallmenich and Henry Wilson.

The election was held in accordance with the provisions of P. L. 1911, Chapter 221 and P. L. 1914. Chapter 108 (the so-called Hennessey Preferential Act).

Upon the holding of the election, a canvass of votes was made by the City Clerk of Bayonne resulting in the finding that there was cast 9,016 legal ballots and 333 illegal or void ballots. Certificates of election were issued by him to Henry Wilson, Horace Roberson, Hugh H. Mara, Matthew T. Cronin and Pierre P. Garven. All of said persons immediately entered upon the discharge of the duties of said office of Commissioner.

Subsequently a recount of said votes was conducted by the County Board of Elections resulting in the following finding:

Name	*No. of Votes*				
	Column				Total
	1	2	3	4	
John J. Cain	3907	65	3	4	3979
Matthew T. Cronin	4296	32	2	2	4332
Bert Daly	4259	47	2	1	4309
John O. Devlin	3976	100	2	1	4079
Pierre P. Garven	4259	73	3	3	4338
Henry Hinse	665	249	5	3	922
Hugh H. Mara	4284	72	2	1	4358
James H. Murphy	3574	133	6	1	3714
Horace Roberson	4425	64	42		4494
John P. Smith.	3587	121	2	1	3711
Robert J. Talbot.	1153	459	5	12	1629
Chas. von Wallmenich	627	298	5	5	935
Henry Wilson	4397	139	3	5	4541

The recount conducted by the County Board of Elections did not, according to its findings, disturb the result of the City Clerk's canvas. Certificates of election were issued by that board to the same

persons who had been declared elected by the City Clerk.

The foregoing tabulation is set out in detail so that the Court may clearly understand the manner in which the election in question was conducted under the provisions of Chapter 108, P. L. 1914.

The form of ballot prescribed by the act is in this wise:

For Commissioners:	First Choice	Second Choice	Third Choice	Other Choice
Louis Coe	X			
William Brown		X		
John Doe			X	
Henry Poe				X
Richard Roe				X

First choice voting is compulsory, *otherwise the ballot is void.* Indeed, there must be indicated as many first choices as there are offices to be filled. Failing that the ballot is void.

Voting in the remaining columns is optional. In the first, second and third columns there can be marked only as many choices as there are offices to be filled. In the fourth or other choice, the voter may indicate his preference for as many candidates as he chooses, provided, of course, that he does not vote for any candidate in whose favor he indicated a preference in any other columns.

The method of determining who is elected follows:

The City Clerk canvasses the vote by adding up the numbers of first choice preferences. If any candidate receives a *majority* of the first choice votes he is thereby elected. Failing that, the second choice votes are added and the result again examined to see if the candidates have received a majority. Likewise as to the third choice votes. Such

of the candidates as fail to receive a majority upon the adding of the first, second and third choices, get credit for the fourth and other choices, and those receiving the greatest number of votes are declared elected.

Appellant's complaint is that such part of Chapter 108, P. L. 1914, as provides that "all ballots shall be void which do not contain first choice votes" is unconstitutional and void. That it should be rescinded from the act and the ballots which were rejected because of the failure of the votes to indicate his preference for at least five candidates in the first column should be counted.

Such ballots were 192 in number. Copies of them are contained in the state of case. Following is a canvass of them:

Name	*Votes*				
	1	2	3	4	TOTAL
John J. Cain	44	17	7	3	71
Matthew T. Cronin	68	6	4	3	81
Bert Daly	94	9	3	3	109
John O. Devlin	36	34	7	6	83
Pierre P. Garven	31	8	10	9	58
Henry Hinse	4	2	4	6	16
Hugh H. Mara	35	10	14	11	70
James H. Murphy	28	15	15	10	68
Horace Roberson	33	24	20	12	89
John P. Smith	27	19	10	22	78
Robert J. Talbot	10	10	5	8	33
Chas. von Wallmenich	1	1	5	11	18
Henry Wilson	38	10	8	15	71

By adding to the number of votes as found and determined by the County Board of Elections, the result of the above canvass, it will be seen that appellant Daly received more votes than the respondent Garven. Had the ballots in question been

counted, Daly and not Garven would have been elected.

No question can be raised in this proceeding as to the statute of the existing government in Bayonne. The result of counting the rejected ballots will not affect any other member of the Board. If the ballots are counted Garven is the only one who will be unseated—for the reason that when the additional votes are credited all the other commissioners will have more votes than Garven or Daly.

Neither can it be said that appellant has been guilty of laches. Immediately after the result was announced by the County Board of elections, the information was filed. Pending the determination of Delvin v. Wilson, 88 Law, p. 180, the trial of the proceeding was held up. Upon the filing of the decision of this Court in Devlin v. Wilson, this proceeding was moved. The trial was had before Judge Speer in the Hudson Circuit Court who sat as Judge of the law and facts.

His refusal to admit the ballots in evidence and to find in favor of the appellant are specified as grounds of appeal.

The fundamental and only question in the case is as to the constitutionality of the portions of the Hennessey Act referred to. It may be said in passing that the Legislature has, since this contest arose, changed the law by striking out the provision that the ballots shall be void unless choices are marked in the first column for as many candidates as there are offices to be filled.

The Constitutional mandate is as follows:

> "Every male citizen of the United States,
> "of the age of twenty-one years, who
> "shall have been a resident of this State

"for one year, and of the county in "which he claims his vote for five "months, next before the election, shall "be entitled to vote for all officers that "now are, or hereafter may be elective "by the people."

Para. 1, Art. 2.

The question involved here was considered by the Supreme Court in two cases: Orpen v. Watson, 87 N. J. Law, 69, and Devlin v. Wilson (unreported).

The Orpen case grew out of the election in New Brunswick and the Devlin case out of the Bayonne election.

The proceedings were by certiorari to review the legality of the City Clerk's finding that certain individuals had been elected. The Supreme Court, through Mr. Justice Bergen, held the act constitutional and dismissed the writs.

Upon review in this Court, the action of the Supreme Court was affirmed. The merits were not discussed in this Court—the appropriateness of the remedy being the only question considered. Inasmuch as the real purpose of the prosecutor was to overthrow the existing government, it was held in line with previous decisions that the Attorney General is the only one who can successfully assail the existence of organized municipal government. Necessarily, this conclusion led to the affirmation of the dismissal of the writ of certiorari.

Devlin v. Wilson, 88 N. J. Law, 180.

Orpen v. Watson, 88 N. J. Law, 379.

I.

Unconstitutionality of Statute.

It must be conceded that the right to vote is not a natural or inherent right. It seems to be regarded as a ~~habitu~~political or public right. Therefore, whatever limitation ~~visits~~ exists upon the Legislature to prescribe the exercise by the voter of this right must be found if at all in the Constitution.

It is the theory of appellant that the guarantee of the Constitution that each qualified voter shall have the right to vote for all elective officers is to be given the broadest interpretation possible. We do not mean to say that the Legislature cannot create and erect all possible safeguards against fraud. However, as was said by Mr. Justice Reed in Ransom v. Black, 54 N. J. Law, 451: "It the effect of any provision is to shut off a voter from the ballot box, such provision must fall before the Constitutional guaranty of the right to vote."

That is exactly what the provisions of the Hennessey Act accomplish. The requirement is that the ballot shall be void unless the voter shall vote in the first column for as many candidates as there are offices to be filled. It might very well happen in a given case that there were only five candidates for five offices. Two of them, perhaps, might be totally unfitted to fill the office. Yet, in order to cast a vote for the fit persons, the voter is compelled to vote for persons who should not be trusted with the administration of public offices. *The only alternative is not to vote at all.*

In the Bayonne election there were but thirteen candidates. Who can say whether or not voters were not disfranchised by being compelled to vote for at least five or not at all.

It is our contention that the constitutional guaranty means that the voter shall [subject to regulations to prevent fraud] FREELY AND UNRESTRICTEDLY vote for all officers. It means that or the guaranty is a sham and affords no protection to the voter.

Certainly the right of suffrage is one of the most important public functions which the citizen may discharge. Indeed, it might be said that it is a duty which he should be compelled to perform. It is at the basis of organized government in this country. The public good will be best served by affording to the electorate entire freedom in the choice of public administrators and we insist that is what the framers of the Constitution had in mind when they wrote the guaranty into that compact.

The portions of the act which are objected to are severable and if violative of the Constitutional mandate may be rescinded. The ballots which were rejected should have been received and counted, and it is urged that there should be a reversal of the Supreme Court herein with directions to receive the ballots and to have the same counted.

ELMER W. DEMAREST,
Attorney for Appellant.

JOHN MILTON,
Of Counsel.

NEW JERSEY

Court of Errors and Appeals.

BERT DALY,
Relator-Appellant,

vs.

PIERRE P. GARVEN,
Defendant-Respondent.

On Quo Warranto.
On Appeal from Supreme Court.

BRIEF FOR RESPONDENT.

I.

The provision of the Hennessy Preferential Act, requiring everyone who votes at an election of Commissioners, under the Commission Government Act, to express on his ballot his first choice for the full number of Commissioners to be elected, on pain that otherwise his ballot will be rejected, is constitutional.

Of course, the general constitutionality of the Hennessy Preferential Act cannot be questioned in the present case; for, if the whole act is unconstitutional, the first attempted election held in Bayonne after the adoption of the Commission Government Act was inefficacious, and the former municipal government was not thereby overthrown. Such former government remained, and those constituting it would hold over in office. This was the ar-

gument on the certiorari instigated by the present relator, which this Court declined to consider.

Devlin vs. Wilson, 88 N. J. L., 180.

In that case it was held that only the Attorney General could attack a *de facto* municipal government, and that until a successful attack by him the statute under which such municipal government was created must be presumed to be a binding enactment.

The relator concedes this, and indeed claims title to office on the theory that he was elected under said enactment, though in defiance of its express terms. His claim is that the Preferential Act is at large constitutional, but that the provision for the rejection of ballots not containing a first choice vote for all the commissioners is unconstitutional and may be exscinded from the statute.

In the New Brunswick case, argued at the same time with the Bayonne case, the Supreme Court held that the provision did not violate the State Constitution. *Orpen v. Watson*, 87 *N. J. L.*, 69. In that case the decision was by Mr. Justice Bergen, sitting alone for the Court under the statute. His opinion on this point is lucid and convincing. I quote it in full in order that the Court need not have to lay aside the brief in order to consult the report of the decision. He wrote as follows:

> "The principal reason urged in support of this writ is, that the statute under which the election was held is in violation of paragraph 1, Article II., of the constitution of the state, which provides that 'Every male citizen of the United States of the age of twenty-one years, who shall have been a resident of this state one

year, and of the County in which he claims his vote for five months, next before the election, shall be entitled to vote for all officers that now are, or hereafter may be, elective by the people.'

"The first ground urged is, that the statute does not permit a free choice because it compels the voter to vote a first choice for each office to be filled, which in the present case is five, to make his vote effective, when he may desire to vote for only one commissioner, and therefore his right to vote is restricted.

"My understanding is that the right of suffrage in organized society is not absolute or inherent, and that the majority of the persons constituting the society may regulate that question as they deem best, except as limited by some organic compact such as the Constitution of our State. So it would seem that on this branch of the case the simple question is whether the Legislature, deeming it wise that some of the powers of the State shall be entrusted to five Commissioners, it can provide that each citizen, if he desires to participate in the selection of such instrumentalities of the State, shall vote for the entire number of officers necessary to exercise, for the common welfare, the delegated powers, and if so, whether such requirement infringes upon his constitutional right to vote for all officers that are elective. I think it must be conceded, that if there be no constitutional limitation, the Legislature could condition the right to vote

for a class of officers upon a requirement to vote for all, and my opinion is that the right reserved in the Constitution to a vote for all elective officers is not restricted by a requirement that he shall vote for as many persons as there are offices necessary to be filled in order to carry on the government. It is not to vote for particular persons that choice is left open, but to aid in filling elective offices; it is a regulation of the method of voting for all elective officers.

"The argument that in voting for only one, the voter thereby advances the chances of one person whom he may prefer to the others, does not take into account that the Constitution reserves no such privilege, either expressly or by implication, nor does it secure him the right not to vote, for, as was said by former Chief Justice Depue in *Bott vs. Secretary of State, 62 N. J. L., 107:* 'The constitutional provision in itself gave no consideration for the qualified voter who, for any reason, was indifferent or non-committal with respect to proposed amendments.'

"The views I have expressed have the support of the Supreme Court of Minnesota, where the precise question now presented was carefully considered and the constitutionality of a statute sustained, by the terms of which voters were required to vote a first choice for as many persons as there were Commissioners to be elected, the Constitution of the State concerning the right of suffrage being substantially

> the same as ours. *Farrell vs. Hicken, 125 Minn., 407; 147 N. W. Rep., 815.* I think it is clear that no constitutional right of any voter has been restricted, infringed upon or hampered by the requirement that he must, in order to have his vote counted, vote his first choice for as many persons as there are offices to be filled in the manner required by the statute assailed."

I care to add nothing to Justice Bergen's deliverance except the following suggestions:

1. There is nothing inconsistent with the constitutional *right* to vote that electors shall *be compelled* to vote. There is nothing in either of the opinions in Ransom v. Black, 54 N. J. L., 446, that even hints that the constitutional right to vote implies a constitutional right *not* to vote.

2. As to compulsory voting the argument that an elector who wants to vote for one officer, *e. g.*, a Sheriff, and for no other, cannot constitutionally be compelled to vote for some other officer, *e, g.*, a County Clerk as well, has no applicability to a case where the voting is for a group of officers together constituting a single board or body. Under the Commission Government Act there has to be in cities of Bayonne's population a board of five Commissioners, and it is perfectly reasonable to require of the electors that they shall vote for a complete Board, otherwise it is supposable that only one or less than a quorum of Commissioners might be elected, and thus the purpose of the act be defeated. The Legislature provided for a Board, and gave every elector the opportunity to vote for a Board; no one can complain of being deprived of the privilege to vote for a part

only of a Board. Whatever may be said as to constitutional officers, it was surely competent for the Legislature in creating offices to be filled by popular election to require all those who desire to participate in the election that they shall vote for all such officers, particularly so where such officers are to constitute a Board.

Counsel for relator have fallen into an error with regard to the provisions of the Preferential Act. They seem to think that votes can be cast only for persons whose names are printed on the official ballot. They say in their brief (p. 7):

> "The requirement is that the ballot shall be void unless the voter shall vote in the first column for as many candidates as there are offices to be filled. It might very well happen in a given case that there were only five candidates for five offices. Two of them, perhaps, might be totally unfitted to fill the office. Yet, in order to cast a vote for persons who should not be trusted with the administration of public offices. The only alternative is not to vote at all. In the Bayonne election there were but thirteen candidates. Who can say whether or not voters were not disfranchised by being compelled to vote for at least five or not at all?"

This is a palpable mistake. The names of candidates can only be printed on the official ballots if petitions of candidacy are duly filed; but the voter is free to write other names on his ballot. By the Preferential Act it is expressly provided as follows (P. L., 1914, p. 173):

> "One space shall be left below the printed names of the candidates of each office to be voted for, wherein the voter may write the name of any person for whom he may wish to vote."

The form of ballot printed in the Preferential Act was only given by way of illustration, and but one blank space was left below the five names. In practice ballots always are printed with five blank spaces, following the statutory requirement of one space for each office to be voted for. See the actual ballots offered on the trial under review and printed in the case.

The false premise of counsel vitiates their argument.

II.

It is not permissible to exscind from the Preferential Act the provision that the electors shall cast a first choice vote for all the commissioners to be elected on pain of rejection of the ballot.

The whole scheme of the legislation will be disarranged if this provision is exscinded, and it is inconceivable that the Legislature would have enacted the statute without it. It is an inseparable part of the plan of voting that the Legislature devised. As well attempt the play of Hamlet with the part of Hamlet omitted.

It is true, as stated by counsel for relator at page 5 of their brief that since this contest arose the Legislature has, in effect, changed the law "by striking out the provision that the ballots shall be void unless choices are marked in the first column for as many candidates as there are offices to be filled" (P. L.,

1916, p. 216); but it by no means follows that the Legislature that enacted the law would have done so without such provision. Indeed, the contrary is the case, for the provision was vital. The scheme of the act was to compel every elector to express his first choice, and only in case a candidate lacked a majority was there to be resort to second, third, or other choice. In the final outcome, a plurality, of course, would elect. The reason for requiring the expression of first choice for all the commissioners was to prevent one candidate, or a combination of candidates, securing an unfair advantage over others. Only by requiring a first choice to be expressed for all five Commissioners, are candidates put on an equal footing. The legisislative intent must be derived from the statute itself, and not from a subsequent emasculation. The Legislature of 1916 has, in fact, adopted a different scheme from that adopted in 1914, and it would be most unfair to give effect to that scheme in favor of 192 voters, who had disobeyed the law, as against 9,157 voters who loyally obeyed the law of 1914, providing for a different scheme. The act of 1914 provides for directions to voters, to be printed on the ballots as follows:

> "DIRECTIONS TO THE VOTER.
>
> * * * * *
>
> "If more than one office is to be filled, vote as many first choices as there are officers to be elected or the ballot will be void"
>
> * * * * * *

In printing the ballots excluded by Judge Speer, these directions to voters, as well as the heading of the ballot, have been omitted as unnecessary. It is a very important feature of the act, and an election held with such ballots, where all but 192 of the vot-

ers obeyed the directions, ought not to be disturbed because the 192 voters were either careless or phenomenally acute. If the latter alternative is the true one, that is, that they thought the provision was unconstitutional and would be exscinded by the Court, they took an unfair advantage over an electorate comprising more than 9,000 voters.

41 N.J. Law 296 & 64 N.J. Law 207 are pertinent decisions

The judgment under review should be affirmed with costs.

GILBERT COLLINS,
Of Counsel with
Defendant-Respondent.